

# **Graduate Attributes**

Gavin McCabe, Sharon Maguire, Helen Stringer, Shelagh Green Careers Service University of Edinburgh 31 March 2021

Governments, employers, prospective students, and their parents and supporters, are asking searching questions about the value of university education and of individual disciplines. This, alongside competitor activity, an economic environment that is particularly harsh for recent graduates, and complex, cross-cutting challenges in areas such as health, climate, and society, presents strong drivers for work developing our students' graduate attributes.

This paper summarises what they are, their potential value, how they can be developed, and how they can support a transformative experience for our students.

## What are graduate attributes?

Graduate attributes should encapsulate the skills, qualities, and attitudes that are intentionally developed through the transformative experience of university education.

High-quality education can be a transformative experience, shaping our ways of knowing, doing, and being. Each student joins the University from different educational backgrounds, cultures, and experiences. While studying we want students to deepen their knowledge and understanding, to ask questions, and to learn how to learn. Through this experience, we want students to broaden their horizons and ways of thinking, and to develop their current skills and abilities and learn new ones, helping them in their studies, future careers, and their role in society. When institutionally identified, articulated, and embedded, these skills, abilities, and ways of thinking are 'graduate attributes'. <sup>1, 2, 3, 4, 5</sup>

There are four different ways in which staff typically conceptualise graduate attributes, falling into two general categories. Understanding these can help us identify individually, and agree collectively, what we mean by 'graduate attributes'. <sup>6, 7, 8, 9</sup>

- Additive graduate attributes are viewed as discrete from other university learning.
  - Irrelevant basic skills that are irrelevant as they are a prerequisite for university.
  - Unrelated useful skills that complement university learning, that have little or no relation to disciplinary learning, and can be 'taught' in a separate supplementary curriculum.



- **Transformative** graduate attributes are viewed as interacting with other university learning.
  - Abilities of application abilities that let students translate, make use of, or apply disciplinary knowledge in new contexts.
  - Integral abilities that infuse and enable university learning and knowledge.

How we choose to view graduate attributes influences their impact on the education experience, and the extent to which they can be used to surface disciplinary distinctiveness.

#### Why are graduate attributes valuable?

Graduate attributes can be used to help us equip our students for the future, support ED&I, create an integrated university experience, and respond to external debate about the value and purpose of HE.

Realising University strategy, vision, and values The focus on developing students' skills and talent and equipping them for the future is evident across Strategy 2030, in particular 'The undergraduate curriculum will support breadth and choice, preparing students, graduates and alumni to make a difference in whatever they do, wherever they do it' <sup>2</sup>. The aims of graduate attributes are also reflected in our values: 'We are a place of transformation and of self-improvement, driven to achieve benefit for individuals, communities, societies and our world' <sup>1</sup>. Graduate attributes can support a range of agendas, such as scholarship, citizenship, and employability through their application in different contexts – in education, society and community, work and career. <sup>10</sup>

Articulating the value of the Edinburgh experience

Clear articulation of the value and purpose of the Edinburgh experience is important for our prospective students, their parents and supporters, and their potential future employers. Identifying and harnessing a shared identity and language through a graduate attributes framework can help show the wealth of opportunity that studying at the University offers. <sup>11, 12, 13</sup>

Creating an integrated and coherent university experience

It can be easy for the constituent parts of the University experience to be seen in isolation, but students' growth and transformation come from the fullness of their life while at University. Given their cross-cutting nature, graduate attributes can offer a shared framework to increase individuals' understanding of what is common, as well as appreciating important disciplinary distinctiveness. They can help schools work together, support individuals to make connections between the different parts of students' curricular, co-



curricular, and extra-curricular lives\*, and increase students' aspirations and motivations around lifelong learning and development. <sup>14, 15</sup>

Equality, diversity, and inclusion

It is well known that inequalities exist in entry to, engagement with, and capacity to benefit from, the diverse range of opportunities available to students while at university. Embedding the development and awareness of graduate attributes through academic curricula can help to ensure **all** students can build these qualities as part of their university experience, not only those with the interest or capacity to engage in opportunities beyond the academic curriculum. <sup>13, 15, 16</sup>

Equipping our students for an uncertain future – in work and society The global environment is one where the rate of change is intensifying and the need for graduates who can help tackle the challenges faced by society and the world is evident. Equipping students with graduate attributes and supporting them to articulate these with confidence are core parts of empowering students for future success and of 'recognising the complexities of a world in which specific knowledge quickly becomes redundant, but a wider skillset combined with the ability to continue to learn sets graduates apart' <sup>17</sup>. For a fuller exploration, see the Curriculum Transformation briefing paper 'Skills for the Future of Work'. <sup>18, 19, 20, 21</sup>

External policy drivers and debates

Debates about the purpose and value of university education continue, including questions about the relative value of different disciplines. Recent reports show how graduate attributes support engagement with these questions, at a sector level, for individual institutions, and importantly for disciplines, where graduate attributes offer an opportunity to highlight their distinctive strengths. <sup>22, 23, 24</sup>

## How can graduate attributes be developed and supported?

Graduate attributes are developed through a combination of curricular, cocurricular, and extra-curricular experiences. However, the curriculum is central to ensuring all students have opportunity to develop their graduate attributes via meaningful experiences, awareness raising, and reflection.

The impact of graduate attributes comes from embedding and supporting them, helping our students transform and grow.

- curricular experiences students' experiences on their academic courses
- co-curricular experiences other activities that are either facilitated by or part of the wider University experience, for example optional workshops, student representation, and peer support activities
- extra-curricular experiences the experiences students have outside of their university life.



<sup>\*</sup> Definitions vary across the sector; here we use the following to distinguish and highlight the importance of each:

Students' development of their graduate attributes requires:

- engaging in meaningful and diverse experiences that build and use a range of attributes
- increasing awareness of the attributes needed and used
- **reflecting** on their use in different contexts to deepen the mastery and build flexibility for future application.

Curricular experiences and intentional design Students' curricular, co-curricular, and extra-curricular experiences are all critical in developing the strongest and most flexible set of attributes, and students derive greatest benefits from harnessing all three. <sup>25</sup> However, curricular experiences enable *all* students to benefit, including those who do not have equal access to, or interest in, co- and extra-curricular opportunities. <sup>13</sup>

In the curriculum, every choice we make about how we teach, support, and assess learning requires a range of attributes in our students. All learning and teaching activities already influence the graduate attributes our students are developing, shaping disciplinary ways of thinking and practising, and the diversity of our pedagogical approaches informs the range of the attributes developed. However, the impact is more substantial when this is intentional rather than a by-product. <sup>10, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30</sup>

The value of intentional curriculum design in supporting graduate attributes prompted the creation of a curriculum toolkit covering 10 curriculum design elements that foster student development and includes extensive examples linked to Teaching Matters. www.ed.ac.uk/employability/curriculum-toolkit

**Awareness** 

Many staff recognise the attributes used during a course, programme, or cocurricular experience, but do our students? How transparent is it to students which attributes they are developing, how, and why? Ensuring a consistent and repeated message throughout the student experience raises their awareness and builds their confidence. Equally, awareness of what is not being developed or what opportunities are inaccessible to some, will help all involved consider ways these gaps can be addressed. <sup>13, 31, 32, 33</sup>

Reflection

Without reflection, students may be aware of the graduate attributes used during an experience but the growth achieved and the impact seen beyond the experience can be limited. In many areas within and beyond the curriculum, reflection is being used to successfully diversify the learning, teaching, and assessment practices and to expand students' development. Where reflective practice is embedded, we generally see positive impacts in students building and strengthening attributes that can then be flexibly and purposefully adapted to new problems and contexts, drawing out and deepening the learning, and stimulating an approach of ongoing learning and development. <sup>34, 35, 36</sup>



#### **Considerations**

Graduate attributes are sometimes criticised for being statements that carry little meaning or value and that is true if they are not integrated, embedded, and supported. Having and enabling an institutional framework of graduate attributes that is contextualised by disciplines can help universities define and deliver the transformative value they see in their educational experiences.

The University has had an agreed framework of graduate attributes for several years.<sup>37</sup> Its efficacy has been limited by the extent and variability to which these attributes have been meaningfully and fully embedded. Curriculum Transformation presents an opportunity to revisit the University's graduate attributes, identify those that reflect our current and future identity and vision, and explore how best to embed and support them. If we choose to do this, some questions and prompts to consider include:

- How do we work towards a shared understanding of how graduate attributes should relate to university learning – are they separate but complementary, or are they integrated?
- How can curriculum design (including assessment) and our quality assurance and enhancement processes support the intentional and effective development of graduate attributes?
- How would we successfully engage the University community and its partners in developing an institutional approach to defining and embedding graduate attributes in the University experience and drawing out disciplinary distinctiveness?
- What barriers may individuals encounter in making graduate attributes part of the University experience and how could we tackle them?
- How would we ensure leadership and coordination that supports effective alignment with institutional priorities and agendas to maximise impact?

#### **References**

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Bowden, J., Hart, G., King, B., Trigwell, K., & Watts, O. (2000). *Generic capabilities of ATN university graduates*. Canberra: Australian Government Department of Education, Training and Youth Affairs



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> University of Edinburgh (2019). *Our vision, purpose and values*. Retrieved from <a href="https://www.ed.ac.uk/about/strategy-2030/our-vision-purpose-and-values">https://www.ed.ac.uk/about/strategy-2030/our-vision-purpose-and-values</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> University of Edinburgh (2019). *Our University in 2030*. Retrieved from <a href="https://www.ed.ac.uk/about/strategy-2030/our-university-in-2030">https://www.ed.ac.uk/about/strategy-2030/our-university-in-2030</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Barnett, R. & Coate, K. (2005). *Engaging the curriculum in higher education.* Maidenhead: Open University Press

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Barnett, R. (2009). *Knowing and becoming in the higher education curriculum*. Studies in Higher Education, 34:4, 429-440, DOI: 10.1080/03075070902771978

- <sup>6</sup> Barrie, S. C. (2004). *A research-based approach to generic graduate attributes policy.* Higher Education Research & Development, 23:3, 261-275
- <sup>7</sup> Barrie, S. C. (2006). *Understanding what we mean by the generic attributes of graduates.* Higher Education, 51: 215–241
- <sup>8</sup> Barrie, S. C. (2007). *A conceptual framework for the teaching and learning of generic graduate attributes*. Studies in Higher Education, 32:4, 439-458
- <sup>9</sup> Barrie, S. C., Hughes, C., Smith, C., & Thomson, K. (2009). Key issues to consider in the renewal of learning and teaching experiences to foster Graduate Attributes. Australian Learning & Teaching Council
- <sup>10</sup> Hill, J., Walkington, H. & France, D. (2016). *Graduate attributes: implications for higher education practice and policy.* Journal of Geography in Higher Education, 40:2, 155-163. DOI: 10.1080/03098265.2016.1154932
- <sup>11</sup> Office for Students (2020). *The importance of good information, advice and guidance*. Retrieved from

https://www.officeforstudents.org.uk/publications/coronavirus-briefing-note-information-advice-and-guidance-for-prospective-students/#importance

- <sup>12</sup> UCAS (2016). Through the lens of students: how perceptions of higher education influence applicants' choices. Retrieved from <a href="https://www.ucas.com/sites/default/files/through-the-lens-of-students.pdf">https://www.ucas.com/sites/default/files/through-the-lens-of-students.pdf</a>
- <sup>13</sup> Swingler, M., Roy, A. W. N., Rolinska, A., & Gardani, M. (2019). *Focus On: Graduate Skills Students' Views on Graduate Skills*. Glasgow: QAA Scotland. Retrieved from <a href="https://www.qaa.ac.uk/docs/qaas/focus-on/focus-on-graduate-skills-student-views-on-graduate-skills.pdf">https://www.qaa.ac.uk/docs/qaas/focus-on/focus-on-graduate-skills-student-views-on-graduate-skills.pdf</a>
- <sup>14</sup> Daubney, K. (2020). Extracted employability: the employability value of what is taught. In Norton, S. & Dalrymple, R. (Eds), *Enhancing Graduate Employability: A Case Study Compendium* (pp. 89-93). York: Advance HE.
- <sup>15</sup> Montacute, R., Holt-White, E., & Gent, A. (2021). *The University of Life Employability and essential life skills and university*. London: The Sutton Trust.
- <sup>16</sup> Speirs, N. M., Riley, S. C., & McCabe, G. (2017). Student-Led, Individually-Created Courses: Using Structured Reflection within Experiential Learning to Enable Widening Participation Students' Transitions Through and Beyond Higher Education. Journal of Perspectives in Applied Academic Practice, 5(2). <a href="https://doi.org/10.14297/jpaap.v5i2.274">https://doi.org/10.14297/jpaap.v5i2.274</a>
- <sup>17</sup> McVitty, D. & Andrews, M. (2021). *Skills to Thrive*. London: Wonkhe. Retrieved from <a href="https://wonkhe.com/wp-content/wonkhe-uploads/2021/01/Adobe-graduate-skills-survey-January2021.pdf">https://wonkhe.com/wp-content/wonkhe-uploads/2021/01/Adobe-graduate-skills-survey-January2021.pdf</a>
- <sup>18</sup> Barnett, R. (2000). *Realizing the University in An Age of Supercomplexity*. Ballmoor, UK: SRHE and Open University Press
- <sup>19</sup> Kettle, J. (2013). *Flexible pedagogies: employer engagement and work-based learning*. The Higher Education Academy. https://www.heacademy.ac.uk/sites/default/files/resources/EE\_wbl\_report.pdf



- <sup>20</sup> Docherty, D. & Fernandez, R. (2014). *Career portfolios and the labour market for graduates and postgraduates in the UK*. National Centre for Universities and Business. https://www.ncub.co.uk/reports/career-portfolios.html
- <sup>21</sup> Valentine, R., Stringer, H., & Green, S. (2021). *Skills for the Future of Work*. The University of Edinburgh.
- <sup>22</sup> Universities UK (2018). *Solving Future Skills Challenges*. London: Universities UK. Retrieved from <a href="https://www.universitiesuk.ac.uk/policy-and-analysis/reports/Pages/solving-future-skills-challenges.aspx">https://www.universitiesuk.ac.uk/policy-and-analysis/reports/Pages/solving-future-skills-challenges.aspx</a>
- <sup>23</sup> The British Academy (2020). *Qualified for the Future Quantifying demand for arts, humanities and social science skills*. London: The British Academy. Retrieved from <a href="https://www.thebritishacademy.ac.uk/publications/skills-qualified-future-quantifying-demand-arts-humanities-social-science/">https://www.thebritishacademy.ac.uk/publications/skills-qualified-future-quantifying-demand-arts-humanities-social-science/</a>
- <sup>24</sup> Wakeham. W. (2016). Wakeham Review of STEM Degree Provision and Graduate Employability. Retrieved from <a href="https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/stem-degree-provision-and-graduate-employability-wakeham-review">https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/stem-degree-provision-and-graduate-employability-wakeham-review</a>
- <sup>25</sup> Barrie, S. C. (2019). *The future of graduate skills: an international perspective* [Keynote presentation]. QAA Focus On Graduate Skills, Glasgow. <a href="https://www.qaa.ac.uk/docs/qaas/focus-on/the-future-of-graduate-skills---an-international-perspective.pdf">https://www.qaa.ac.uk/docs/qaas/focus-on/the-future-of-graduate-skills---an-international-perspective.pdf</a>
- <sup>26</sup> QAA (n.d.). *Subject Benchmark Statements*. Retrieved from <a href="https://www.qaa.ac.uk/quality-code/subject-benchmark-statements">https://www.qaa.ac.uk/quality-code/subject-benchmark-statements</a>
- <sup>27</sup> Ambrose, S.A., Bridges, M.W., DiPietro, M., Lovett, M.C., & Norman, M.K. (2010). *How learning works: Seven research-based principles for smart teaching*, Chapter 7. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- <sup>28</sup> Clarke, M. (2018). *Rethinking graduate employability: the role of capital, individual attributes and context*. Studies in Higher Education, 43:11, 1923-1937
- <sup>29</sup> Abrami, P.C., Bernard, R.M., Borokhovski, E., Wade, A., Surkes, M.A., Tamin, R., & Zhang, D. (2008). *Instruction interventions affecting critical thinking skills and dispositions: a stage 1 meta-analysis*. Review of Educational Research, 78(4), 1102-1134
- <sup>30</sup> Abrami, P.C., Bernard, R.M., Borokhovski, E., Waddington, C., Wade, A., & Persson, T. (2015). *Strategies for teaching students to think critically: a meta-analysis*. Review of Educational Research, 43(2), 275-314
- <sup>31</sup> Morris, S., Cranney, J., Jeong, J. M., & Mellish, L. (2013). *Developing psychological literacy: Student perceptions of graduate attributes*. Australian Journal of Psychology, 65(1), 54-62
- <sup>32</sup> Rust, C., & Froud, L. (2016). *Shifting the focus from skills to 'graduateness'*. AGCAS Phoenix, 148, 8-9
- <sup>33</sup> Swingler, M., Armour, S., Bohan, J., Cleland-Woods, H., Curry, G. B., & Roy, A. W. N. (2016). Where am I now and where do I want to be? Developing awareness of graduate attributes in pre-honours students. New Directions in the Teaching of Physical Sciences, Volume 11, Issue 1



If you need this document in an alternative format please contact curriculum.programme@ed.ac.uk



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> McCabe, G. & Thejll-Madsen, T. (2018). *The Reflection Toolkit*. Retrieved from www.ed.ac.uk/reflection

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> University of Edinburgh (n.d.). *Student-Led, Individually-Created Courses*. Retrieved from www.ed.ac.uk/sliccs

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> University of Edinburgh (n.d.). *The Edinburgh Award*. Retrieved from <a href="https://www.ed.ac.uk/edinburgh-award">www.ed.ac.uk/edinburgh-award</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> University of Edinburgh (n.d.). *Graduate Attributes*. Retrieved from www.ed.ac.uk/graduate-attributes