Exploring newly graduated doctors’ workplace learning about the approach to the end-of-life using Cultural Historical Activity Theory

Shaun Peter Qureshi

shaun.qureshi@ed.ac.uk
Contents

• Background
  • Approach to the end of life

• Methods
  • CHAT

• Results

• Future work

• Summary
Medical doctors must access the physical, psychological and social means to provide optimal care\textsuperscript{e.g.\,(1)}

Best practice guidelines emphasise anticipatory planning in advance of the very end-of-life\textsuperscript{e.g.\,(2)}

Medical doctors must be able to anticipate the dying patient\textsuperscript{e.g.\,(3)} – but this is often difficult and/or subjective\textsuperscript{e.g.\,(4)}
Why it matters

REALISTIC MEDICINE

Dying without dignity
Investigations by the Parliamentary and Health Service Ombudsman into complaints about end of life care
Confidential Inquiry into premature deaths of people with learning disabilities (CIPOLD)
Background

• Medical doctors must access the physical, psychological and social means to provide optimal care \( \text{e.g.} (1) \)

• Best practice guidelines emphasise anticipatory planning in advance of the very end-of-life \( \text{e.g.} (2) \)

• Medical doctors must be able to anticipate the dying patient \( \text{e.g.} (3) \) – but this is often difficult and/or subjective \( \text{e.g.} (4) \)
Background

• Medical doctors must access the physical, psychological and social means to provide optimal care e.g. (1)

• Best practice guidelines emphasise anticipatory planning in advance of the very end-of-life e.g. (2)

• Medical doctors must be able to anticipate the dying patient e.g. (3) – but this is often difficult and/or subjective e.g. (4)

To explore how newly graduated medical doctors understand and learn about care of patients approaching the end of life
Methods (1)

• Complementary qualitative methods

• Analysis of language used by/acceptable to UK medical doctors
• Scoping study methodology
  • Iterative inclusion/exclusion criteria generation
  • Broad sample of medical literature discussing the approach to the end-of-life in the general hospital setting
• Qualitative Content Analysis of 269 included documents
  • Analysis of how the approach to the end-of-life is expressed, articulated and conceptualised
Methods (2)

To explore how medical doctors understand and learn about care of patients approaching the end of life

What are the influences on how these understandings are developed and learned about?

• Newly graduated (first two postgraduate years) doctors in South East Scotland invited to participate in interviews

• Data generated through semi-structured interviews exploring experiences of caring for patients who had died in the general hospital setting

• Qualitative data underwent inductive thematic analysis\(^5\)
Methods (2)

To explore how medical doctors understand and learn about care of patients approaching the end of life

**To explore how the approach to the end of life is understood and conceptualised**

**What are the influences on how these understandings are developed and learned about?**

- Newly graduated (first two postgraduate years) doctors in South East Scotland invited to participate in interviews
- Data generated through semi-structured interviews exploring experiences of caring for patients who had died in the general hospital setting
- Qualitative data underwent inductive thematic analysis\(^5\)
Key Findings

• Approach to end-of-life not a discrete entity, considered with reference to:
  • Judgements about the patient
  • The practice of and treatments available to the doctor

• Default medical care organised/planned for “expectation of cure”

• When patients approaching end-of-life ongoing standard default care becomes negative (“invasive”, “aggressive”)

• Decisions should be made to alter goals of care – more positive conceptions of care

• Medical schools may present a dichotomous view of end-of-life care as separate conceptually and geographically from acute care

• Understanding of the relevance of end-of-life care to acute hospital care is learned about through practice
Cultural Historical Activity Theory

- Workplace learning and understanding through practice
- Socio-cultural learning theory\(^{(5)}\)
- Socio-material learning theory\(^{(5)}\)
- Describing real-world learning situations
- Planning solutions to complicated work-based problems
- Fundamental unit of life is the activity of the organism\(^{(7)}\)
- Everyone influences and is influenced by social and cultural contexts\(^{(8)}\)
- Unit of analysis is the activity system - consists of:\(^{(9)}\)
  - Subject aiming to bring about change (object) to reach a goal (outcome)
  - Mediated by use of tools
  - Influenced by rules and division of labour
Mediating artefacts

Subject

Rules

Community

Objective

Division of labour

Adapted from (6)
Mediating artefacts

Subject

Rules

Community

Objective

Division of labour
Mediating artefacts

Subject

Rule

Objective

Community

Division of labour

seen as junior in a hierarchical system of doctors and other MDT
Consultant makes decisions; juniors responsible for reviewing sick and deteriorating patients but not allowed to make decisions.
Mediating artefacts

Subject

Rules

Community
seen as junior in a hierarchical system of doctors and other MDT

Objective

Providing good quality care for patients;
Providing good quality end of life care

Division of labour
Consultant makes decisions; juniors responsible for reviewing sick and deteriorating patients but not allowed to make decisions
Mediating artefacts

Subject

Rules

Community

Division of labour

Providing good quality care for patients;
Providing good quality end of life care

Standard default medical care aims to cure and/or prolong life

Consultant makes decisions; juniors responsible for reviewing sick and deteriorating patients but not allowed to make decisions

seen as junior in a hierarchical system of doctors and other MDT
Mediating artefacts

Physical Tools
- Handover
- Clinical Documentation
- DNACPR orders

Psychological Tools
- Pre-existing knowledge of patients
- Interaction with other MDT members (nurses’ input)
- Expectations of responsible consultant

Subject
Community
Rules
Objective

Standard default medical care aims to cure and/or prolong life

Providing good quality care for patients;
Providing good quality end of life care

Consultant makes decisions; juniors responsible for reviewing sick and deteriorating patients but not allowed to make decisions

Division of labour

Consultant makes decisions; juniors responsible for reviewing sick and deteriorating patients but not allowed to make decisions
Mediating artefacts

Subject
- Rules
  - Handover
  - Clinical Documentation
  - DNACPR orders

Psychological Tools
- Pre-existing knowledge of patients
- Interaction with other MDT members (nurses’ input)
- Expectations of responsible consultant

Objective
- Division of labour
  - Consultant makes decisions; juniors responsible for reviewing sick and deteriorating patients but not allowed to make decisions
  - Providing good quality care for patients;
  - Providing good quality end of life care

Physical Tools
- Handover
- Clinical Documentation
- DNACPR orders

Signs (semiotic)
- Age
- Mobility
- Diagnoses
- Judgements about quality of life
- Patients’ ongoing harmful behaviour

Standard default medical care aims to cure and/or prolong life

Community
seen as junior in a hierarchical system of doctors and other MDT
• Contradictions or tensions within or between systems have the potential to facilitate transformation\textsuperscript{(10)}

• Resolution of contradictions leads to subjects and activity systems becoming qualitatively different\textsuperscript{(11)}
**Physical Tools**
- Handover
- Clinical Documentation
- DNACPR orders

**Psychological Tools**
- Pre-existing knowledge of patients
- Interaction with other MDT members (nurses’ input)
- Expectations of responsible consultant

**Signs (semiotic)**
- Age
- Mobility
- Diagnoses
- Judgements about quality of life
- Patients’ ongoing harmful behaviour

**Rules**
Standard default medical care aims to cure and/or prolong life

**Subject**
Community
seen as junior in a hierarchical system of doctors and other MDT

**Objective**
Providing good quality care for patients;
Providing good quality end of life care

**Division of labour**
Consultant makes decisions; juniors responsible for reviewing sick and deteriorating patients but not allowed to make decisions
Mediating artefacts

Subject

Objectives

Division of labour

Consultant makes decisions; juniors responsible for reviewing sick and deteriorating patients but not allowed to make decisions.

Providing good quality end of life care

Providing good quality care for patients;

Standard default medical care aims to cure and/or prolong life;

Rules

Community

seen as junior in a hierarchical system of doctors and other MDT.

Physical Tools

- Handover
- Clinical Documentation
- DNACPR orders

Psychological Tools

- Pre-existing knowledge of patients
- Interaction with other MDT members (nurses’ input)
- Expectations of responsible consultant

Signs (semiotic)

- Age
- Mobility
- Diagnoses
- Judgements about quality of life
- Patients’ ongoing harmful behaviour

Physical Tools

- • Handover
- Clinical Documentation
- DNACPR orders

Psychological Tools

- • Pre-existing knowledge of patients
- Interaction with other MDT members (nurses’ input)
- Expectations of responsible consultant

Signs (semiotic)

- • Age
- • Mobility
- • Diagnoses
- • Judgements about quality of life
- • Patients’ ongoing harmful behaviour
Mediating artefacts

Subject

Rules

Physical Tools
- Handover
- Clinical Documentation
- DNACPR orders

Psychological Tools
- Pre-existing knowledge of patients
- Interaction with other MDT members (nurses’ input)
- Expectations of responsible consultant

Objective

Division of labour
Consultant makes decisions; juniors responsible for reviewing sick and deteriorating patients but not allowed to make decisions

Providing good quality care for patients;
Providing good quality end of life care

Community
seen as junior in a hierarchical system of doctors and other MDT

Signs (semiotic)
- Age
- Mobility
- Diagnoses
- Judgements about quality of life
- Patients’ ongoing harmful behaviour

Providing good quality care for patients;
Providing good quality end of life care

Standard default medical care aims to cure and/or prolong life
Future Work
Summary

• Dichotomous view of acute care as separate from EOL-care is not reflective of the realities of practice

• Understandings of the approach to EOL are co-constructed by newly graduated doctors in and with their work environment
  • Socio-cultural / Socio-material apparatus (CHAT) appropriate for analysis.

• System based contradictions could be focuses for intervention to improve workplace learning and practice
  • Tensions between the organisation of the systems and perceived need of patients may be a potential area for further work

• Future research should investigate the activity of other MDT members, and consider how contradictions between interacting activity systems influence understandings of patients approaching EOL.
References

• (1) GMC. (2016). *Outcomes for Graduates.*
• (2) NICE. (2015). *Care of the dying adult in the last days of life.*
References


- (9) de Feitjer J et al. (2011). Students' perceptions of patient safety during the transition from undergraduate to postgraduate training: An activity theory analysis. Advances in Health Sciences Education. 16(3):347-358.


Exploring newly graduated doctors’ workplace learning about the approach to the end-of-life using Cultural Historical Activity Theory

Shaun Peter Qureshi
shaun.qureshi@ed.ac.uk

This work was supported by an award from the University of Edinburgh Principal’s Teaching Award Scheme