



Centre for Research in
Education Inclusion
and Diversity



Citizens now or citizens in the making? What a study of school transitions and pupil participation can tell us about children as citizens

"Young Citizens and Society: Fostering Civic Participation"

2nd-3rd September 2016

University of Strathclyde

Jane Brown & Linda Croxford
Moray House School of Education
University of Edinburgh



Centre for Research in
Education Inclusion
and Diversity



Introduction

- Presentation concentrates on **empirical findings** from a study of children's/young people's views on participation/voice/ across the primary-secondary transition
- To date, research which has investigated the extent to which policy endorsement of pupil participation is enacted in Scottish schools shows “good practice” is uneven and “patchy” (Hulme 2011)
- Present study supports above findings



Centre for Research in
Education Inclusion
and Diversity



Research design

- Mixed method study: self-report questionnaires (n = **740** children) and focus group (n=**130** children)
- Sample included children at end of primary school (P7) and pupils in second year (S2) at secondary school
- Included representative sample of **25** schools (15 primary and 10 secondary), situated in 4 areas in Scotland
- **Questionnaires:** we asked about school ethos/teacher/child relations, opportunities for decision-making/responsibility at school, what activities were on offer, participation in them, thoughts about transition
- **Focus groups:** we asked about when/where children felt more responsible at school, the purposes of participation and what helped them take part



Centre for Research in
Education Inclusion
and Diversity



Research questions

- To investigate pupil's views on participatory opportunities on either side of primary-secondary transition
- To identify to what extent children view themselves as responsible members of their school community
- To explore what is authentic and meaningful participation (i.e. voice, responsibility), from the point of view of pupils



Centre for Research in
Education Inclusion
and Diversity

A framework for understanding “active citizenship” in schools



- We focused on “*pragmatic dimension*” of active citizenship drawing on Schereen’s conceptual model which highlights students taking action and “hands on” experience
- Described as: “*informal learning embedded in school context*” (Schereen, 2011: 202)
- Non-formal curriculum included school ethos, decision-making structures (i.e. pupil councils), informal leadership (i.e. peer mentoring), extra curricular clubs/activities and pupil participation



Centre for Research in
Education Inclusion
and Diversity

General overview of findings



- Taking part identified as integral to experience of primary school but more complex picture emerged in terms of secondary pupils
- Clear differences found between sectors
- Social relations with teacher, peers/parents key to facilitating participation
- Responsibility for **others** (“younger ones”) found to be significant for primary pupils while responsibility for **self**, highly valued by secondary pupils but responsibility for **self** was less likely to be carried through to learning in classrooms



Centre for Research in
Education Inclusion
and Diversity

School ethos and pupil engagement



- Overall, **68%** of primary children and **66%** of young people at secondary school agreed with the statement: *I mostly enjoy school*
- In schools with a developed participatory ethos (rated on range of measures) children/young people more likely to say that they: *mostly enjoyed school*
- Pupils (mainly boys) with “low activity scores” were much more likely to disagree with: *I mostly enjoy school*, and agree with: *I am not the kind of person that joins clubs and teams*



Centre for Research in
Education Inclusion
and Diversity

Pupil input into decision-making at school



- ***Voting***: overall, only **42%** of children/young people agreed they had a chance to do this at school
- ***Pupil council/parliament***: **89%** of pupils said their school had a pupil council but only **17%** said that they had taken part in it
- ***Influence of councils***: although **58%** of pupils felt it had an impact, there were high levels of uncertainty – especially among girls
- In focus groups girls said they would not put themselves forward and appeared to self exclude from this forum



Centre for Research in
Education Inclusion
and Diversity

Decision-making in the classroom



- *“Teachers mainly decide what happens in class”* - **85%** of secondary pupils agreed with this statement, compared to **64%** at primary school
- Choosing topics to work on: secondary - **31%** compared to **60%** at primary; how pupils worked in class (i.e. group work) - **47%** secondary pupils said they had a say while **61%** of children at primary agreed they had input
- In focus groups secondary pupils described feeling disempowered in the classroom by the use of worksheets, didactic teaching styles. Drama, technical subjects, as well as noteworthy, “special” teachers who were exceptions to this



Centre for Research in
Education Inclusion
and Diversity

Leadership and responsibility at school



- **Key finding:** in terms of responsibility, primary children talked about responsibility for **others**, whereas secondary pupils discussed responsibility for **self**
- In focus groups primary children raised being a “buddy” to the youngest pupils as a significant way that they behaved responsibly at school
- Questionnaire findings show differences between sectors i.e. **48%** primary children said they took part in this activity, compared to **11%** of secondary pupils



Centre for Research in
Education Inclusion
and Diversity

Being a buddy at primary school



- Children derived considerable satisfaction and confidence from being a “buddy” to younger pupils
- The said that they enjoyed the special bond they developed with younger pupils and the fact that the “younger ones”:

“Listen to what you say and look up to you.” and

“You make sure they are doing the right thing.”



Centre for Research in
Education Inclusion
and Diversity

Responsibility for self at secondary school



*There are more subjects and clubs. I have more **independence** at secondary school. There is more maturity shown. (Girl, urban school)*

*In secondary you are intrusted with **responsibility** and **freedom**, a feeling that I have hardly ever felt during my years at primary school. (Boy, urban school)*

*We can go out for lunch and I love that idea because it gives me more of a **choice** and I like that because it gives me **freedom** as well. The whole aspect of switching classes, it's smart instead of the whole year learning the same thing. (Boy, non urban school)*



Centre for Research in
Education Inclusion
and Diversity

Participation and social relations



- Now widely accepted that “*participation is a relational process*” (Jupp Kina 2012; Mannion et al 2015)
- Children/young people identified “special teachers” as promoting participation at school and primary pupils indicated that it would be very difficult **NOT** to take part at primary school with expectations of teachers
- Our findings show how relationships with juniors were vital for children’s sense of responsibility at primary school whereas young people at secondary school derived a sense of responsibility/independence from freedom of movement and association with a wider network of peers



Centre for Research in
Education Inclusion
and Diversity



Final comments

- **Key finding:** variable opportunities for participation across school sectors. Does this mean that:
- Primary pupils - citizens now and S2 secondary pupils citizens in the making?
- Opportunities for taking part in primary school are superseded by new and more exciting experiences (e.g. peer/teacher association, freedom of movement) at secondary where pupils say they have more independence, autonomy and choice



Centre for Research in
Education Inclusion
and Diversity



References

Hulme, M., Mckinney, S., Hall, S. & Cross, B.. (2011) Pupil Participation in Scottish Schools *Improving Schools*, 14 (2):130-144.

Mannion, G., Sowerby, M., & l'Anson, J. (2015). *How young people's participation in school supports achievement and attainment*. Edinburgh: Scotland's Commissioner for Children and Young People (SCCYP) [online]. Retrieved from <http://www.sccyp.org.uk/ufiles/achievement-and-attainment.pdf>.

Ross, H. & Brown, J. (2013) ***Teachers' Perceptions of pupil active citizenship and the transition from primary to secondary school*** A Gordon Cook Foundation Commissioned Research Project
http://www.research.ed.ac.uk/portal/files/12564933/RossBrown2013_GCFProjectReport_AsDelivered.pdf

Schereens, J. (2011) Indicators on informal learning for active citizenship at school. *Educational Assessment, Evaluation and Accountability*, 23, 201-222.