LITERATURE REVIEW

RELIGIOUS EDUCATION IN A MULTI-CULTURAL SOCIETY: SCHOOL AND HOME IN COMPARATIVE CONTEXT

WORKING PAPER

Sheila Riddell and Michalis Kakos, Centre for Research in Education Inclusion and Diversity, University of Edinburgh

INTRODUCTION

As indicated in the Country Notes, the sixteenth century Scottish Reformation led to the development of the Presbyterian Church of Scotland. Other forms of Protestantism in Scotland include Episcopalianism, a High Church version of Protestantism which survived alongside the dominant Church of Scotland, and a range of Free Presbyterian Churches, which were created as a result of schisms in the Church of Scotland. Episcopalians tended to be found in the cities, particularly Edinburgh, where English influence was greatest, and members of the Free Presbyterian Church were concentrated in the Western Isles. In Aberdeenshire and the Highlands, pockets of Roman Catholicism survived the Reformation. Unsuccessful attempts were made in 1715 and 1745 to restore the Stuart dynasty to power, and this led to a gradual loss of population from the Highlands, a process which was accelerated by the Highland Clearances during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. After the Jacobite rebellions, Roman Catholicism appeared to be in decline, but numbers were strongly boosted by immigration from Ireland in the second half of the nineteenth century in response to economic hardship in Ireland and opportunities in Scotland. Irish immigrants, many of whom were Catholic, settled in the central belt, particularly on the west coast.

The historical intersection of religion and geography underpins the shape of Scottish education today. The state school system is comprehensive and, with one exception, co-educational. The majority of schools are non-denominational, but there is a significant Roman Catholic sector. A very small number of primary schools are either Episcopalian or Jewish.

As explained below, most discussion on religion in Scotland has focused on the question of sectarianism in the form of tension and possible discrimination between Catholics and Protestants. In this context, the justification of a separate Roman Catholic education sector in an era of secularisation has been debated, and there has also been discussion of the role which Catholic schools may make in combating or contributing to sectarianism Although membership of other faiths is growing, and there is a concentration of Muslims in and around Glasgow and other Scottish cities, there has been far less discussion of other forms of religious discrimination, and relatively little discussion of whether the number and type of faith schools should be expanded to reflect shifting population trends.

RELIGION AND SOCIETY

1a. Religious identity and practice

Religious affiliation in Scotland

In the 2001 Census, where a question on religion was asked for the first time, 42% of the Scottish population identified themselves as members of the Church of Scotland, and 16% reported that they were members of the Roman Catholic Church. Seven per cent of the population identified themselves as Other Christian, and about 1% belonged to other faiths. Over a quarter said that they had no religion. The issue of what counts as church membership is discussed more fully in sections on social attitudes and secularisation. It is evident that all of the Christian churches have experienced a decline in membership, with older people much more likely to report a religious affiliation than those in younger age groups. The decline has been particularly steep for the Church of Scotland, whose members tend to be older than those of the other churches. The proportion of those with no religion has been growing rapidly.

The sectarianism debate

As noted above, much of the discussion around religion and identity in Scotland focuses on the extent and nature of sectarianism, and the extent to which a separate Catholic education sector contributes to or alleviates discrimination. The debate on sectarianism was reignited in 1999, the year in which the Scottish Parliament was established, by James Macmillan, a Catholic composer, who made a much-reported speech at the Edinburgh Festival in which he made the following allegations:

> In many walks of life – in the workplace, in the professions, in academia, in the media, in politics and in sport – anti-Catholicism, even when it is not particularly malign, is as endemic as it is second nature. Scotland is guilty of 'sleep-walking' bigotry, a writer recently claimed. (Macmillan, 2000, p. 15)

Macmillan's speech, which was largely rhetorical rather than based on hard evidence, was published in a book edited by Tom Devine, a Professor of Scottish History at Edinburgh University, entitled *Scotland's Shame?: Bigotry and Sectarianism in Modern Scotland*. The book included contributions by writers of fiction as well as historians and sociologists. A striking contrast in the book was that whilst the novelists tended to argue that sectarianism was an important feature of Scottish culture, the contributions by quantitative sociologists such as Rosie and McCrone (2000) and Paterson (2000), suggested that there was no longer any evidence of discrimination against Catholics in terms of education and employment outcomes, and increasingly little to distinguish Catholics from others in terms of broad social attitudes. Williams and Walls (2000), on the other hand, used qualitative data to argue that, at least in the west of Scotland, anti-Catholic discrimination was still believed to be widespread. The evidence presented by these commentators is discussed more fully below.

The seriousness with which the new Scottish Parliament regarded the problem of sectarianism was evidenced by the funding of an anti-sectarian campaigning organisation, Nil by Mouth, which focused energy particularly on sectarianism surrounding football. An anti-sectarian working group and action plan were also established. In addition, in 2005 the Scottish Executive published a review of evidence on religious discrimination and sectarianism in Scotland (McAspurran, 2005).

The Scottish Executive publication drew extensively on Bruce et al. (2004), who suggested that whilst there was evidence of some religious disagreements between Catholics and Protestants in Scotland historically, these had tended to focus on arguments about the existence of heaven and hell, and there was also evidence of some disapproval of 'mixed marriages'. Discrimination, they suggest, was largely absent in the field of employment. They note that during the late nineteenth and

early twentieth century, many Catholics migrated to Ireland from Scotland in order to escape poverty and famine. Like many immigrants, because of their low levels of education, they tended to be employed in low-skilled jobs and, as their level of educational qualifications rose, so too did their position in the labour market. Bruce et al. question the extent to which widespread discrimination existed, pointing out that indigenous Scots with few or no qualifications were similarly concentrated in low-level occupations. The authors acknowledge, however, that there was a strong belief in the existence of discrimination, despite the lack of concrete evidence. To illustrate this point, on the front cover of their book *Sectarianism in Scotland*, a poster is printed with the headline 'Macaulay Shipyard: Welders Wanted – Catholics Need Not Apply'. This is in fact a spoof poster, which was never actually displayed despite the popular belief that jobs were publicly advertised in such a way so as to explicitly exclude Catholics.

Bruce et al. also argue that individuals who tried to stir up anti-Catholic sentiment in the latter part of the nineteenth century and early part of the twentieth century (e.g. James Begg, John Hope and Jacob Primmer), received little popular support. Jacob Primmer, for example (1842-1914) was a working class graduate of Edinburgh University who went on to become a Church of Scotland Minister. He was eventually appointed minister of Townhill, Dunfermline, where he launched vigorous attacks on Popery and Irish nationalism, as well as attacking 'the demon drink'. However, rather than attracting much support, he appears to have been regarded as a trouble-maker, and at one point relations with the Dunfermline Presbytery became so bad that he was offered £100 to resign. For many years, the General Assembly withheld part of his salary because he was so unpopular. Bruce and colleagues argue that, rather than illustrating the acceptability of anti-Catholic views, the careers of Primmer and his ilk illustrate the popular rejection of such opinions.

Similarly, in the 1920s and 1930s, a number of politicians and organisations (e.g. the Scottish Protestant League and the Protestant Action Society) espoused anti-Catholic views, alleging, for example, that Catholics were used to undermine trades union activity in areas such as mining and were generally driving down the wages of the indigenous population. However, no member of the clergy publicly supported the SPL or the PAS, and public support was short-lived.

Bruce et al. acknowledge that there clearly were examples of anti-Catholic bigotry in Scotland, but, unlike Northern Ireland, such views were never institutionalised and failed to gain widespread support. The authors point out that there were some examples of the state appearing to favour Catholics. For example, when Catholic schools joined the state system in 1918, they benefited from keeping their original terms of reference, in particular denominational guidance and observation, unlike the Church of Scotland schools which joined the state system in 1872. Furthermore, Bruce et al. argue that historical discussions of sectarianism tend to fall into the trap if homogenising the Catholic population of Scotland. Whilst many Catholics were poor immigrants, some were from middle class Irish or Scottish backgrounds, and these people tended to do as well as others living in Scotland. Football appears to be the main arena in which overtly sectarian ideologies emerge in modern Scotland. Bruce et al suggest that young, working class men use sectarian songs and chants at matches between Glasgow Rangers and Celtic in order to rile the opposition. They generally do not mean the words they sing, and do not carry anti-Catholic or anti-Protestant views into their everyday lives.

It should be noted that, whilst Bruce et al. (2004) argue that the case for rampant sectarianism in Scotland has been exaggerated, others, such as Devine (2000a, 2000b) maintain that it continues to be a significant and negative feature of Scottish

culture. It is apparent that debates on sectarianism have spilled over into many areas of social policy and social research in Scotland, including education. Those who were persuaded by Macmillan's arguments of ongoing and endemic sectarianism maintained that there was an urgent need to defend the separate Catholic education sector, since it played a vital role in reinforcing the cultural identity of Scottish Catholics and ensuring that their right to equal educational opportunities was upheld. At the same time, sociologists were encouraged to examine large-scale surveys, which more recently included questions on religious identity, to explore the nature and extent of religious discrimination. Their finding that there was broad social equality between Catholics and others in Scotland was used by some to question whether Catholic schools were still necessary.

The nature of the ongoing skirmish between those on different sides of the sectarianism debate is illustrated by the response to the publication of statistics by the Scottish Government on cases of religious hatred and religiously motivated crime. The figures analysed 726 cases between January 2004 and June 2005 where people were charged with religiously aggravated offences. It was found that in 64% of cases the abuse or assaults were motivated by hatred against Catholics, and by hatred against Protestants in most of the remaining cases. Most of the attacks were on the streets or close to football matches, and they generally involved drunken young men. In an article in The Guardian on November 28th 2006 http://www.guardian.co.uk/uk/2006/nov/28/religion.catholicism Keith O'Brien, the Scottish Catholic Church's senior cleric, was quoted as saying: 'Sadly, this document shows that Catholics in Scotland are still many times more likely to be the victims of a sectarian attack than any other group'. Professor Steve Bruce, of Aberdeen University, commented that since 90% of the incidents involved verbal abuse and breach of the peace, this suggested that religious intolerance was a minor problem. 'I'm pleasantly reassured', he said, 'that 90% of these cases didn't involve violence. That puts it far, far below wife-beating and racial attacks, and below gay-bashing'.

Muslim identity in Scotland

Evidence on the link between religion and social attitudes and outcomes will be reviewed in more detail below. At this point, it is important to note that the dominance of debates around sectarianism has over-shadowed other important discussions relating to religion, national identity and education. In addition, the focus on sectarianism, with its exclusive concern with the relationship between Catholic and Protestant communities, has led to very little attention being paid to the social position, identity and education of other religious minorities, particularly Muslims. Whereas in England, sociologists such as Farzana Shain (2003) and Louise Archer (2003) have explored issues around religion, ethnicity, gender and educational identity, no such studies have been conducted in Scotland. As suggested by Arshad (2003), this might be because Scotland has a much lower minority ethnic population than England, and until recently perhaps had a sense of complacency that religious extremism or Islamophobia were English rather than Scottish problems. However, a number of recent incidents, including the brutal murder of a white teenager in Glasgow by a group of Asian youths, and the involvement of Muslim doctors employed in Scotland in attempted terrorist attacks on London and Glasgow, have underlined the point that much more attention needs to be paid to the creation of social cohesion between Muslims and the indigenous Scottish population and it appears that the Scottish Parliament is now taking issues of racism in Scotland more seriously.

Hopkins (2004) is one of the few researchers to conduct qualitative work on the identities of young Muslim men in Scotland. He carried out eleven focus groups and twenty two individual interviews to explore issues of Scottishness, the local community, being a young man and being a Muslim. Most of the respondents were born in Scotland, but many continued to identify with the country of their parents' birth (generally Pakistan, but also other countries in Africa and Asia). Ninety eight per cent identified themselves as Muslim, although the level of religious practice and religiosity varied widely. Some young men were able to discuss the various teachings of their religion easily, whilst others struggled to remember the five pillars of Islam. They occupied a range of class positions, and one identified as being gay, thus underlining the heterogeneity of the group. The young men talked about how they felt that they 'got the blame' for September 11th, and that aspects of Scottish culture, such as getting 'pissed' and going out clubbing to 'pick up a girl' are 'completely not allowed for a Muslim'. There were some indications that a minority of young Muslim men participated in clubbing and drinking in order to make them feel more Scottish. They also felt that behaving and dressing modestly was important for Muslim men and women, and this was another aspect of Scottish society from which they felt alienated. The young men commented additionally that 'ladies wearing mini-skirts' and magazines showing pictures of naked women made life difficult for Muslim men because they acted as 'distractions'.

Respondents were asked to consider what actions might be taken to challenge the social exclusion of Muslims in Scotland. On the basis of respondents' comments, Hopkins suggests that there should be a greater focus on the multiple and diverse nature of the Muslim community in Scotland, which would challenge the homogeneous view of Islam presented in the media. In addition, educating people about Islam and what it means to be a Muslim would also act against the marginalisation of young Muslim men in Scotland. Overall, the young men felt that they were simultaneously included and excluded by Scottish culture. On the one hand, they felt Scottish on account of their birth, accent, upbringing and education. But on the other hand they felt excluded by aspects of Scottish culture which centred on drinking and going to pubs and clubs. There is clearly a need for more qualitative work focusing on the social identity of Muslims in Scotland, including research on the identity of Muslim women and girls and people of different ages.

Scottish national identity, Anglophobia and Islamophobia

Hussain and Miller (2004; 2007) have explored the social attitudes of Scottish Muslims, and compared these with the attitudes of majority Scots and English-born people living in Scotland. Data were drawn from a module included in the 2003 Scottish Social Attitudes Survey (SSAS), which examined the attitudes of majority Scots (defined as the general sample of the SSAS excluding those born outside Scotland, whose partner was born outside Scotland, who are not 'white' or who are Muslim). In addition, 12 focus groups and 1,500 telephone interviews were conducted with Pakistani Muslims living in Scotland and English born people living in Scotland.

Minorities' perception of majority attitude, compared with the actual attitudes of majority Scots

An important finding of Hussain and Miller's work is that minority groups in Scotland believe that majority Scots hold a more negative view of them than is actually the case. Muslims are particularly likely to believe that they are unpopular with majority Scots. To illustrate this point, the authors noted that 48% of Muslims and 27% of English people living in Scotland believe that majority Scots think they are taking jobs, housing healthcare and other forms of support from majority Scots. 60% of Muslims and 48% of English born people believe that majority Scots think they can

be 'never be fully committed to Scotland'. Eighty one per cent of Muslims and 78% of English people think that majority Scots believe that they will always be more loyal to other Muslims around the world/England rather than Scotland. By way of contrast, only a small percentage of majority Scots expressed any concern about economic factors, but a slightly larger percentage doubted the loyalty of Muslims or English-born people living in Scotland.

There were also disjunctions with regard to beliefs around inter-marriage and working together. Fifty six per cent of Muslims think that majority Scots would be unhappy if a relative married someone from their background, and 25% of Muslims feel that Scots would be unhappy to work beside them. By way of comparison, 32% of majority Scots said that they would be unhappy if relative married a Muslim, and 4% said they would be unhappy to work alongside a Muslim. The authors conclude that whilst minorities recognise some degree of social exclusion, they tend to exaggerate the strength of these feelings amongst the majority population. There is clearly a need to take action in Scotland to reassure minority ethnic groups that they are indeed welcomed and valued.

There were diverse views about the criteria which qualified an individual to claim Scottish identity. Forty eight per cent of English people living in Scotland felt that it was necessary to be born in Scotland to be accepted as a true Scot, or to have Scottish parents (36%). Amongst Muslims, only 9% felt that parentage was important, but 20% felt that birthplace was relevant. Majority Scots appeared to have fairly rigorous views about qualifications for Scottishness. Sixty four per cent felt that birthplace was most important and 18% felt you had to be white. A third of majority Scots said they would deny a Scottish passport to anyone not truly Scottish.

Fifty two per cent of Majority Scots were apprehensive about a Muslim influx into Scotland, and 42% were concerned about an influx of English people. Fifty five per cent of Majority Scots felt that Muslims 'had not done a great deal to condemn terrorism' in the aftermath of September 11th. However, most majority Scots welcomed a multi-cultural society and said they would support any discrimination law on race, religion or gender.

The authors concluded that Islamophobia and Anglophobia are often connected, and lack of knowledge and friendship between groups might exacerbate matters. Age, gender and level of education also appeared salient.

1b. Changes in the relationship between religion and society (modernisation / secularisation theses)

In this section, we consider the extent to which Scotland is becoming a secular society, and the way in which loss of faith identity is interacting with other factors, such as loyalty to a particular political party.

National and religious identity in modern Scotland

The establishment of the Scottish Parliament in 1999 prompted a renewed interest in the question of Scottish identity and raised questions concerning the possible link between religious and national identity (see, for example, Bond and Rosie, 2002, and Bruce with Glendinning, 2003). Historically, Scottish Catholics tended to support the Labour Party, particularly in the west of Scotland, partly as a result of their relatively poor economic position. The Labour Party in Scotland has over recent years strongly supported devolution, but has opposed the establishment of a separate Scottish state. The Scottish Nationalist Party, campaigning for independence, has tended to have its roots in more affluent and rural parts of Scotland outwith the central belt,

such as Aberdeenshire and Perth and Kinross, where the majority of the population would have traditionally identified themselves as Church of Scotland. In the light of these traditional political and religious adherences, sociologists sought to address the question of whether devolution had loosened or intensified these group differences. There was also a desire to explore the hypothesis that the growing trend towards secularisation would weaken the link between religion and national identity.

In order to address these questions, an additional module to the Scottish Social Attitudes Survey (SSAS) was funded by the Economic and Social Research Council (ESRC).

The focus of the module was to look at:

- Links between religion, politics, ethnic identity and sectarian attitudes;
- How often people attended church;
- To what extent people relate to conventional religion;
- Links between religious beliefs and sensitive moral issues;
- Other forms of spirituality other than conventional religion.

Based on their analysis of these data, Bruce and Glendinning argued that Scotland is a former Christian society with a large minority of active Christians within it. The largest group in Scotland is now those of no faith (37% of respondents, compared with 36% affiliating themselves with the Church of Scotland and 14% with Catholicism). This group appears to have increased by 50% over the last 25 years, although it should be noted that the SSAS findings are at some degree of variance with those of the 2001 Census – see above. One third of survey respondents were over 55 years of age, and half of these respondents said they were members of the Church of Scotland, thus underlining the link between age and religious affiliation.

A large proportion of the sample said they believed in God, but when this was later tested it emerged that respondents were employing a very broad definition of belief, holding to the view that 'something is there'. There was little evidence of taking up new age spirituality, and those who were interested in this area tended to equate it with alternative therapy or exercise regimes such as yoga or tai chi. University educated women who were under 55 were particularly interested in these dimensions of spirituality.

The distinctiveness of different religious groups in Scotland

An important measure of the integration of different religious groups is the extent to which they live in discrete geographical areas, marry members of their own community, maintain voting patterns reflecting traditional tribal loyalties and express attitudes on a range of moral questions which mark them out as different from other groups. Growing homogeneity between groups is likely to reflect a loosening of the power of religion to define key aspects of individual identity. What do the data tell us?

Bruce et al. (2004) used 2001 census data to compare the extent of residential segregation of Catholics and Protestants in Glasgow, where Catholics make up 29% of the population. There were no council wards in which Catholics made up a majority of residents, although 45% of Toryglen residents were Catholic and 43% of Hutchesontown. Catholics make up 30% of the supposedly Protestant strongholds of Bridgeton and Govan. Overall, the authors conclude that there is no obvious geographical pattern to Catholic residency in Glasgow. The area with the smallest proportion of Catholic residents, Pollokshields East (12% Catholic) has the highest proportion of Muslims (four in ten residents are Muslim). This suggests that Muslim

geographical segregation may be a significant issue which has attracted relatively little attention. By way of contrast, in Belfast, where 42% of the population is Catholic, eleven council wards are more than 80% Catholic, and five council wards are 90% Catholic, suggesting that religion and geography are much more closely connected here and segregation is much more marked.

Voting patterns may be another litmus test of community distinctiveness, and Bruce and colleagues have conducted an analysis of religion and voting patterns in Scotland over time. In Scotland, there has always been a strong association between Protestantism and Unionism, taken to mean the union of England and Scotland and a recognition of their joint position at the centre of the British Empire. Working class and middle class Protestants in Scotland tended to vote Conservative until the middle of the twentieth century. Working class and middle class Catholics in Scotland, on the other hand, tended to vote Labour, and recent analysis of voting trends shows that, even controlling for social class, Catholics are more likely to be Labour supporters than their Protestant counterparts, and church-going rather than nominal Catholics have even stronger preferences (see table 1).

However, the subsequent table (table 2) shows that Catholic loyalty to Labour is very strongly linked to age; younger Catholics are no more likely to vote Labour than their Protestant counterparts, and their most common choice was not to vote at all.

In the following sections, we examine attitudes towards a range of moral and social issues. Overall, it appears that Catholics are becoming indistinguishable from the rest of the population with regard to where they live, how they vote and wider social attitudes, providing evidence in support of the idea that religion is becoming a less salient feature of identity for the majority population in Scotland, but not necessarily for the Muslim minority, whose social attitudes have been analysed in far less detail.

Table 1: Religion and political preference, Scotland 2001 (%)

Political preference	Roman Catholic	Protestant	No religion	Other religion
Did not vote	34	22	41	33
Conservative	0	12	5	5
Labour	51	36	28	29
Liberal Democrat	4	14	9	19
Scottish National Party	5	12	11	7
Other parties	3	1	3	5
	100	100	100	100
N	229	689	592	92

Source: Scottish Social Attitudes Survey

Table 2: Labour voting in the 2001 general election by religion and age/class

% of each group voting Labour	18-34	35-54	55+	Non-manual	Manual	All
Catholic	29	52	73	50	52	51

N	69	77	79	88	117	225
All others	22	35	36	29	37	32
N	341	495	537	684	554	1,373

Source: Scottish Social Attitudes Survey

The evidence presented above provides widespread support for the secularisation thesis, and researchers like Voas (2006) has conducted detailed analysis of geographical patterns of religious decline in Scotland, using data from the 2001 census which asked a question about religion for the first time. He concluded that the absolute size of the swing to no religion has been uniform across the country, but some urban wards, particularly in Edinburgh, show larger swings away from religion than other parts of the country. The pattern seems to be that people raised in a strongly religious area are more likely to retain their religious identification than people with the same family background in a less religious environment. Field (2001) suggests that opinion poll data support Brown's thesis of the 'haemorrhage of faith', with Scotland caught up in the throes of secularisation, shedding its reputation as a particularly religious nation. However, Field suggests it would be premature to label Scotland a post-Christian society, since many people who are not active church-goers still retain an adherence to a particular religious group, along with a vague belief in God. In terms of European opinion polls, Scotland hovers around the mean in terms of religious beliefs, apparently less religious than countries such as Ireland, Italy, Portugal and Spain, but more religious than France and Scandinavia. North and South America have much higher levels of commitment to religion than is the case across most of Europe.

1c. Religious socialisation (especially within the family); transmission of religious and moral values

Attitudes towards inter-marriage between different religious groups

We were unable to find examples of qualitative studies exploring the transmission of religious values within families and across generations – this is clearly a gap in knowledge which our current research project will begin to address. However, a number of recent quantitative studies and data drawn from large-scale surveys provide insights into the social attitudes of different religious groups and those of no religion, providing indications of how particular attitudes and values may be transmitted or interrupted across generations.

Religion and attitudes to inter-marriage and personal morality

The extent to which minority groups inter-marry with the majority community is an indication of their degree of acceptance by the majority, and also of their own desire to be included or to remain distinctive and separate. The extent to which both partners are of the same faith is also likely to have an impact on the strength of religious socialisation in the family. The Catholic Church historically disapproved of inter-marriage, and non-Catholic partners were obliged to promise that children of the marriage would be brought up as Catholics. According to two large-scale surveys (The Scottish Social Attitudes Survey and the 2001 Census), there appears to have been a massive change over time with regard to inter-marriage. Amongst Catholics in Scotland aged 65-74, 94% were married to a Catholic, whereas amongst the youngest age groups (those aged 25-34), more than half of all Catholics in Scotland were married to non-Catholics. In Glasgow, 40% of Catholics had non-Catholic spouses. Interesting comparisons may be made with the USA, where only 3% of marriages are racially mixed, and Northern Ireland, where in 1991 only 2% of marriages were religiously mixed. In the Glasgow survey, only 6% said that religion

was a factor influencing who they could have as a friend, and Muslims were more likely to say this than other groups.

Data on church attendance in Scotland also point to a loosening of the transmission of religious values in Scottish homes. As noted earlier, there has been a general loosening of identification with churches, and, although the decline in identification with the Church of Scotland is most advanced, the 2001 Scottish Social Attitudes survey showed that 20% of those brought up Catholic no longer identified themselves as members of the Catholic Church, defining themselves instead as having no religion. Brierley (2002) has analysed church attendance over time, noting that Mass attendance peaked in the 1950s and remained stable for a period of time, declining rapidly from the 1970s onwards. Between 1984 and 2002, Church of Scotland attendance fell by 37%. Over the same period, the Catholic Church recorded a drop of 42%. Recruitment to the priesthood has also been in rapid decline, falling from 196 entrants to seminaries in 1976 to 57 in 1996. We were unable to find data on religious observance for other groups in Scotland.

Information from the Scottish Social Attitudes Survey reported by Bruce et al. (2004) suggest that in general Scots have a liberal approach to moral issues, and religion has a relatively small influence on their views compared with age, social class and education. The tables below (table 3 and 4) show attitudes to personal morality amongst SSAS survey respondents, and, more specifically, attitudes to homosexuality by age and religion. It is evident that age is far more important than religion in influencing attitudes to homosexuality. Religion appears to have a stronger influence in shaping attitudes to sex education. Secular middle class people are most supportive of teachers explaining homosexuality to children (fewer than one in ten thinks this is wrong), and secular working class people are more opposed (one in five think that this is wrong). Older Catholics are the least supportive, with almost half believing that it is wrong for teachers to explain homosexuality to children in school.

Religion, age and class intersect in their influence on attitudes to abortion. Only a minority of Scots think abortion is wrong almost always, whereas two thirds of older Catholics take this view. Older churchgoers of all religious groups are the most disapproving of abortion, and 90% of older churchgoers see adultery as wrong in almost all circumstances irrespective of religious group.

Overall, there is evidence of an ongoing process of homogenisation, so that the moral attitudes of young people are remarkably similar, irrespective of their religion of upbringing or the school they attended. The Catholic Church has very distinctive views on a number of issues connected with personal morality, opposing artificial contraception, abortion, sex before marriage and homosexuality. There appears to be a widening gap between what the Catholic hierarchy would like people to believe, and what ordinary people actually believe and practice, for example, the fact that the birth rate of Catholics in Scotland is the same as that of non-Catholics suggests that Church teaching on the evils of artificial contraception are ignored. Similarly, 14% of co-habitees in Scotland are catholic, directly in line with their representation in the population. Indeed, according to the 2001 Census, members of the Church of Scotland and Muslims were less likely to be co-habiting than Catholics. As noted above, there is a lack of qualitative data to illuminate the findings of large-scale surveys, and the social attitudes of Muslims and other minority religious groups remain largely unexplored.

Table 3: Personal morality, Scotland, 2001 (%)

Do you think it is personally wrong or not wrong for …	Always wrong	Almost always wrong	Wrong sometimes	Not wrong at all	Can't choose	Total
A man or woman to have sexual relations before marriage	10	5	11	65	7	100
School teachers to explain homosexuality to teenagers	14	8	13	51	13	100
A woman to have an abortion	11	12	37	29	10	100
Adults of the same sex to have sexual relations	38	7	10	30	14	100
A married person to have sex with some one other than their spouse	59	26	8	2	3	100

Source: Scottish Social attitudes Survey (self-complete supplement N= 1,381

Table 4: Views on homosexuality by religion and age – Percentage of each group who think homosexuality is always wrong

Age group	Roman Catholic	Protestant	No religion	Other religion
18-34	19	12	17	15
35-54	34	36	31	30

35+	62	61	58	38

Source: Scottish Social Attitudes Survey (self-complete supplement N= 1,398)

Discriminatory attitudes, religion and other social variables

An additional module was inserted into the Scottish Social Attitudes Survey on attitudes to discrimination, analysed by Bromley and Curtice (Scottish Executive, 2003). About fifty per cent of respondents felt that many groups, including women, disabled people, minority ethnic groups (where discrimination based on religion and ethnicity may intersect) and gay and lesbian people experienced some degree of discrimination. Seventy per cent of respondents wanted to 'get rid of prejudice'. Bromley and Curtice explored the factors which appeared to influence attitudes towards ethnicity and religion, and the relationship between different variables is summarised in the table below.

It is striking that Catholics appear to have more progressive and egalitarian attitudes with regard to racial equality compared with Church of Scotland/Presbyterians respondents, who, it should be noted, are likely to be older than others. This may be linked to their greater support for the Labour Party, which has taken a more pro-active stance on issues of racial equality compared with other political parties. SNP supporters are much more likely than other groups to say that equal opportunities for black and Asian people have gone too far, that ethnic minorities take jobs from other people and ethnic minorities do not provide additional skills in the labour market. Conservative voters, who are likely to be older than other respondents, are likely to say that they would mind inter-racial (and therefore possibly inter-religious) marriage. In the previous section, we noted the growing similarity of attitudes towards aspects of personal morality across religious groups. In terms of wider discriminatory attitudes, there appear to be some marked differences between Catholics and other groups, although the Bromley and Curtice analysis does not explore the inter-relationship of variables.

Table 5: Relationship between racial prejudice and 'sociological' factors

% who say:	Equal opportunities for black people & Asians gone too far	Would prefer an MSP who is white	Would mind inter-racial marriage	Ethnic minorities take jobs from other people	Ethnic minorities do not provide skills	Language translation is a waste of money
All	18	11	17	20	18	35
Age						
18-24	16	5	6	22	24	37
65+	18	19	29	23	16	34
Sex						
Male	19	12	17	21	21	41
Female	17	10	17	20	16	31
Education						
Degree	8	4	11	7	7	22
No quals	24	14	21	28	20	36
Class						
Professional	11	8	14	20	12	30
Working class	21	11	17	25	22	35
Party id						
Labour	17	11	19	18	17	32
Lib dem	10	10	14	8	8	27
SNP	23	9	15	26	22	34
Conservative	16	15	26	21	18	45
None	21	10	12	24	28	42
Religion						
CoS/Presb	24	16	23	23	24	38
Catholic	15	7	15	14	15	31
No religion	15	7	12	10	17	35
Church attendance						
Once a week	13	13	17	13	11	34
Never	18	10	15	22	20	35
Urban/rural						
Big cities	10	15	15	18	17	25
Remote rural	14	16	16	20	13	39

1d. Religion and social differentiation: the interaction of religion and social class, education, gender, nationality and ethnicity; religion and political movements

In this section, we explore research findings on the relationship between religion, social position and social mobility, and contrast these findings with beliefs about the extent of employment discrimination in Scotland. Data on religion and educational outcomes from the 2001 Census are considered in Section 2.

Religion, employment and social class

Bruce et al. (2004) argue that since 1945, when Labour was elected to power on a manifesto of nationalising key industries and expanding the welfare state, there has been a radical change in the structure of the labour market and in the social position of Catholics in Scotland. Discrimination, which might have existed in small-scale enterprises, became far less acceptable in large state-controlled industries and in the growing public sector. The comprehensive school reform programme of the 1960s meant that Catholics, whose educational ambitions had previously been blocked by the lack of Catholic senior secondary schools, were able to have access to the same educational opportunities as others, so lack of educational qualifications was no longer an impediment to social mobility.

Large scale survey data show that in Scotland as a whole, and in Glasgow more specifically, Catholics are slightly more likely than Protestants to work in lower status semi-routine or routine jobs, and less likely to work in managerial and professional positions. However, there are strong associations with age – among older age groups, the gap between Catholics and Protestants was large whereas amongst younger age groups it was much less (see table below).

Table 6: Percentage of people in non-manual occupations by age group and religion of upbringing

Age group	Roman Catholic	Church of Scotland	No religion	Other religion	All
18-34 years	58	63	45	65	58
35-54 years	47	58	45	62	55
55+ years	26	49	33	63	48

Note: Non-manual refers to ‘employers and managers’, ‘intermediate occupations’ ‘small employers and own account workers’ in the National Statistics Socio-economic Classification 2000.

Source: Scottish Social Attitudes Survey (N=1,597)

Geography, as well as age, contributes to the complexity of the picture; more Catholics live in the declining industrial heartland of the west central belt, where there are far lower levels of economic activity compared with other parts of Scotland (20% of the male working age population of Glasgow is economically inactive). The table below (table 7) contrasts the social class position of religious groups within the middle age cohort for Scotland and Glasgow. In Glasgow, a lower percentage of people are in the higher social class groups compared with the rest of Scotland, but, as in the rest of Scotland, the difference between Catholics and those brought up in the Church of Scotland is relatively small. Over time, the gap between Catholics and Protestants in Scotland has narrowed, and, on present trend, is likely to disappear. On the other hand, there is a relatively large gap between those in the 'other religion' category and the rest of the population. This of course represents a diverse group, ranging from Episcopalians to Muslims and Buddhists. Muslims, however, make up a significant proportion and in the middle age cohort appear to be quite socially disadvantaged.

Table 7: Religion of upbringing and social class in middle age cohort, Scotland and Glasgow City, 2001 (%)

	Roman Catholic	Church of Scotland	No religion	Other religion	All
Scotland					
AB	22	24	19	30	24
C1	27	29	26	29	28
C2	17	20	20	16	18
D	21	19	24	16	19
E	13	9	12	9	10
	100	101	101	100	99
Glasgow City					
AB	16	17	18	23	18
C1	23	25	25	27	25
C2	15	15	13	13	14
D	23	21	20	17	21
E	24	22	24	21	22
	100	100	100	101	100

Note: The results are for 35-54 year olds. Category AB includes managerial and professional occupations. E includes lowest grade workers and those who are on state benefits or unemployed.

Source: GRO Scotland, Census 2001

Religion, social class and social mobility

Paterson and Ianelli (2006) conducted further detailed analysis of religion and social mobility using the Scottish Household Survey of 2001. The questions posed in their paper were the following:

- What are the religious differences in the distributions of class origins and class destinations, in the movement between these (absolute mobility) and in the association of these (relative mobility or social fluidity)?
- Do changes in social fluidity across cohorts vary among people with different religious affiliation?
- Are there religious differences in the association of origins and education, in the association of education and destinations, or in the role of education in social fluidity, and do any of thee vary over cohorts?

As in the studies described above, Paterson and Ianelli concluded that, in younger cohorts, there is no religious difference in social status, and that in older cohorts, Catholics are generally of lower status than Protestants and the non-religious. Social fluidity does not vary, even for older cohorts, and does not change over time. The reason for convergence in social status is attributed to the equalising of educational attainment among the groups, with Catholics having benefited particularly from the introduction of comprehensive schools in the 1960s. These reforms opened up access to advanced level education which had previously been denied to many pupils in less socially advantaged areas of Scotland. Because Catholics tended to be concentrated in particular parts of the west central belt, the advent of comprehensive schools had a particularly marked impact on their educational opportunities and outcomes. Significantly, Paterson and Ianelli concluded by underlining the finding that there is no evidence for any of the cohorts that the labour market rewards to education differ by religion.

Perceptions of discrimination

Whilst large scale survey analysis indicates that amongst younger groups there are no associations between religion and educational or occupational outcome, different findings have emerged from some qualitative work. Walls and Williams (2003) used qualitative methods to investigate people's experiences and perceptions of sectarian discrimination in employment in Scotland. They interviewed seventy-two people in the west of Scotland, thirty nine Catholics and thirty three Protestants, chosen so that half of the sample was aged 46 and half were 66. The respondents were asked to talk about their experience and knowledge of discrimination at work. The authors conclude that their respondents' accounts show evidence of discrimination, which has been ignored in many other studies. They also suggest that the experiences of the Irish Catholic minority have often been ignored by researchers of ethnicity, and should be accorded a higher profile.

Bruce et al. (2005), in a subsequent article, took issue with the ways in which Walls and Williams interpreted their qualitative data, and questioned their conclusions. One of their central criticisms was that respondents were treated as 'expert witnesses', able to make a sound assessment of whether discrimination existed in a particular workplace. To do this, they maintain, the interviewees would have to have prior knowledge of the proportion of Catholics in a given population (16% overall in Scotland, 30% in parts of Scotland). They note that respondents may have assumed that there should have been equal numbers of Catholics and non-Catholics in any given workplace, although clearly this would be a false assumption. They also question whether respondents would have sufficient information to make a judgement with regard to the religious status of workplace colleagues. Since Catholics are visibly similar to the rest of the population and do not have distinctive religious practices, such as daily prayers, there would be very little reliable data to draw on. Whereas a person's name might provide some indication of their religion, this has increasingly become a weak indicator as inter-marriage becomes more common. Finally, they note that most of the comments made by respondents were based on inference and rumour rather than direct personal experience of workplace discrimination.

Overall, Bruce et al. suggest that there appears to be a disjunction between perceptions of discrimination and the reality. Large scale surveys show very little or zero difference in the social position and social mobility of Catholics and Protestants in Scotland, and the remaining social differences tend to be among older people living in the west of Scotland. However, when asked whether discrimination still exists, many Scottish people believe that it is fairly prevalent. The Scottish Social Attitudes Survey, for example, asked if respondents believed that 'being a Catholic limits employment or promotion opportunities in present day Scotland'. Catholics were more likely than non-Catholics to think such a disadvantage exists; one third of those raised as Catholics believe that their religion still matters. Eighteen per cent of Catholics said they had personally experienced discrimination, compared with three per cent of other respondents. In Glasgow, the majority of both Catholics and Protestants believe that such discrimination exists, and that it is very common (15%) or quite common (38%). Bruce et al. suggest that allegations of anti-Catholic discrimination, such as those made by James Macmillan, may fuel belief in its existence, despite the fact that quantitative data provide no evidence to support the reality of discriminatory practices in the workplace. As noted earlier on, Muslims and English minorities also believe that they are the victims of negative attitudes from the majority, and even though exclusionary attitudes clearly exist, they do not appear to be as significant as minorities believe them to be.

SECTION 2: RELIGION AND SCHOOLS

2a. Parental choice of school and selectivity among schools

In this section, we consider the nature of the debate on religion and school choice, noting the differences in English and Scottish pre-occupations. In England, there is currently great concern about social segregation in schools and the unequal educational opportunities this produced. As noted below, faith schools have been found guilty of fostering covert social selection practices. In Scotland, there has been far less focus on this area, and no attention has been paid to the way in which parental choice and school selection operate in Catholic schools. This does not imply that there is no problem of social segregation in Scottish schools. A recent OECD report on Scottish education noted that: 'Socio-economic status is the most important difference between individuals. Family cultural capital, life-style and aspirations influence student outcomes through the nature of the cognitive and cultural demands of the curriculum, teacher values, the programme emphasis in schools and peer effects' (OECD, 2007, p.15).

Religion and school choice: England

The1980 Education Act covering England and Wales, which reflected the previous Conservative Party's desire to promote the discipline of the market within the public sector, allowed parents a greater degree of choice of school for their children. Educational researchers subsequently debated the impact of this policy. Stephen Ball (2003), using qualitative data to analyse patterns of school choice in London, maintained that greater social selectivity has resulted, whereas Stephen Gorard et al. (2001), using quantitative data, maintained that, in general, schools have become more socially diverse than was the case when they had drawn from particular catchment areas which were often socially polarised.

In 2003, the Department for Children, Schools and Families (DCSF) issued a Code of Practice on School Selection which applied to schools in England, underlining the need for fair selection procedures. A further Code of Practice, highlighting unacceptable practices associated with covert social selection, was published in 2007. Faith schools in England (which include Church of England and Catholic schools) are allowed to operate a test of religiosity, but there is an agreement that 25% of places in new faith schools will be reserved for pupils from other faith groups or no faith. Research by Coldron et al. (2008), commissioned by the DCSF, investigated the way in which schools were applying admissions criteria in the light of high levels of social segregation between schools leading to unequal educational opportunity. Schools are obliged to publish over-subscription criteria, and the researchers found that voluntary aided and Foundation schools were less likely to give priority to children in public care and children with medical or social needs. Only 15% of schools had any faith related criterion, but for these it was a high priority. The great majority of voluntary aided schools designated with a religious character used faith related criteria. The 2007 Admissions Code prohibits schools from taking account of parents' personal interests or other circumstances, except in the case of fait schools who may enquire about membership or relationship with a church or religious denomination.

The study concluded that where schools are their own admissions authority, particularly voluntary aided (faith) schools, aspects of admissions arrangements lend themselves to covert selection. This makes the schools' raw results compare favourably with those of other schools, but has a negative impact on equality of educational opportunity. The reason for this is that there is a very close association between attainment and social class, and children from more advantaged

backgrounds educated with children with similar backgrounds will do extremely well. Conversely, children from disadvantaged backgrounds educated mainly or exclusively with children from similar backgrounds will have their attainment depressed.

Research by Allen and West (2007) examined the extent to which religious schools are segregating pupils by religiosity and, associated with this, ethnicity, and to what extent religious schools are selective in terms of their social composition and (related to this) academic ability. Using data from the National Pupil Database, the researchers concluded that:

- Many religious schools in London are not serving the most disadvantaged pupils
- Overall, religious schools educate a much smaller proportion of pupils eligible for free school meals and their intakes are significantly more affluent than the neighbourhood they are located in
- Within the religious sector there are both Catholic and Anglican socially selective 'elite' secondary schools which appear to 'select out' low income religious families, thereby displacing them to religious schools with less affluent composition.

Religion and school choice: Scotland

In Scotland, the responsible body for education is the local authority, rather than the school, and it is the local authority which establishes admissions arrangements, normally using a catchment area system. However, under the terms of the 1981 Education (Scotland) Act, parents may make a placing request which differs from the place designated for the child by the local authority. Catholic schools are allowed to give priority to children from Catholic families, although the precise definition of what counts as a 'Catholic family' is not clear. The possibility of choosing a religious school is not well advertised, for example the Scottish Government publication *Choosing a School: A Guide for Parents* (Scottish Government, 2007) makes no mention of religion and school choice.

The Catholic Church in Scotland was concerned that the opening up of school choice might lead to a reduction in parents choosing Catholic schools for their children, and when the school choice legislation was enacted a letter from Cardinal Winning was read out in all churches reminding parents of their religious obligation to choose a Catholic school for their child. Data are not published on the religious background and ethnicity of children attending Catholic schools, and how this differs by neighbourhood. Large scale surveys have explored attitudes to the existence of a separate Catholic sector, and data from these sources is presented in the following section. There does not appear to be a major problem with over-subscription in relation to Catholic schools as appears to be the case in England, probably because most are located in the west central belt where the population has been falling. In response to the general problem of falling rolls, Glasgow City Council has amalgamated some schools and closed others both in the Catholic and non-denominational sectors. Particularly in the west, the raw results of Catholic secondary schools are often below the national average, reflecting local poverty. Since most parents use raw results rather than value added measures in judging 'good' and 'bad' schools, Catholic schools have not been obviously more attractive than other schools in terms of academic attainment, although their general reputation might make them more attractive.

Research on parents and school choice was conducted following the passage of the 1981 Education (Scotland) Act by Adler, Petch and Tweedie (1989). This study examined the implementation and impact of the reform in three Education Authorities and a survey of 1,000 Scottish parents to determine their responses to the legislation. The researchers found that parents who exercised choice were motivated by a desire to avoid the school in their attendance area rather than to find the optimal school for their child. The reasons given by parents tended to do with social factors such as disciplinary climate or general reputation, or proximity. Few parents emphasised educational considerations such as examination results. A study using a sub-set of Adler et al.'s data conducted by Echols and Willms (1995) examined the relationship between parents' socio-economic status and their sources of knowledge and reasons for choice. A major theme in the findings was the salience of parents' socio-economic status, with middle class parents much more likely to exercise choice than others. Religion did not feature in the analysis at all, but this may have been because of the way in which the questions were posed in the survey – parents were not explicitly asked about the importance of religion in their choice of school. Although reasons underpinning parents' choice of school is clearly an extremely important topic and relates to the high level of educational inequality in Scottish schools, it does not appear to have attracted the attention of researchers over recent years.

As noted above, Catholic schools in Scotland have generally not been over-subscribed. However, in 2001 a challenge was mounted under human rights legislation with regard to West Lothian Council's denial of a place to a non-Catholic boy in St Margaret's Academy, Livingston. The solicitor acting for the family maintained that the legislation on which the council based its rules for offering places in denominational schools was incompatible with the European Convention on Human Rights. The Catholic Church defended its right to give preference to Catholic pupils. The Catholic Education Commission's spokesman commented: 'Our position is Catholic schools are essentially for Catholic pupils. We are talking about the rights of Catholic parents. This is why Catholic schools exist'. The council's decision to refuse the placing request was upheld at appeal, and the attempt to challenge this decision through the Court of Session was unsuccessful. With changing demographics and social mobility, it is possible that more Catholic schools will become over-subscribed in the future and the issue of their selection procedures could become more fraught. The lack of Scottish data on religion and school choice suggests another gap in knowledge with this research may be able to address, using qualitative rather than quantitative data.

2b. Policy debate: place of faith schools; separate vs. comprehensive provision.

Over recent years in Scotland and England, there have been debates about the place of faith schools within an increasingly secular society, although, like the debate on faith schools and parental choice, the contours of the discussion have been different in the two countries. In England, the school system and the ethnicity of the population are far more heterogeneous than is the case in Scotland. The former Prime Minister, Tony Blair, supported the expansion of faith schools, and there is already a substantial faith-based sector within the state system, made up of Church of England and Catholic schools, as well as a much smaller number of Jewish and Muslim schools. Following the terrorist attacks in London on 7th July 2005, questions have been raised about the limits of multi-culturalism and the best ways of achieving community cohesion within a multi-cultural society. The Runnymede Trust commissioned a report entitled *Faith Schools and Community Cohesion* (Osler,

2007), and in 2007 Sir Keith Ajegbo chaired an independent review on *Diversity and Citizenship Curriculum* (DfES, 2007) which, amongst other things, recommended that the secondary curriculum for Citizenship Education should include a new element entitled 'Identity and Diversity: Living Together in the UK'. The Commission on Integration and Cohesion published its report entitled *Our Shared Future*, which called for a new model of rights and responsibilities, a new emphasis on mutual respect and civility, and a recognition that 'diversity can have a negative impact on cohesion, but only in certain circumstances'. Ed Balls, the current Education Minister, has stated that the Government no longer wishes to expand the number of faith schools, and is attempting to rein in covert social selection amongst those which exist (see above) by enforcing the School Admissions Code more rigorously.

In Scotland, there have been rather muted requests for the establishment of a Muslim school in Glasgow by some members of the local Muslim community, who have received some support from Catholics, but by and large there have been no demands either for the expansion of the existing religious sector to include other faith groups, nor to dismantle current provision. Rosie and McCrone (2000) extracted the following data from the 1997 Scottish Election Survey on attitudes to Catholic schools in Scotland.

Table 8: Attitudes towards separate Catholic schools

% by column	All	Church of Scotland	Roman Catholic	None
Retain separate schools	20	18	52	12
Phase out	78	80	45	86
N	871	365	126	270

Source: Scottish Election Survey, 1997

It would appear that there is a widespread belief that integrated schools are preferable. About half of those identifying as Catholic also appear to be in favour of integrated schools; the Scottish Social Attitudes Survey showed that in 2001 59% of Catholics were in favour of phasing out Catholic schools. In Glasgow, younger people were more likely to support the statement 'Catholic schools create intolerance'. However, there continues to be a religious divide here; 40% of Protestants feel that Catholic schools create intolerance, whilst 50% of Catholics feel that they do not. Those who were raised with no religion are most opposed to segregated schools.

Conroy (2001) and Finn (1999) have implied that those in favour of integrated schools must be anti-Catholic bigots, as was Alexander Ratcliffe who argued against the inclusion of Catholic schools in the state sector under the terms of the 1918 Act. However, opposition to religious schools within the state sector may be based on the belief that religion and education should be separated, as in the French state education system. Furthermore, proponents of integrated education may have concerns about sectarianism and racism, and may consider it preferable for children of different religious groups and no religion to be educated together. It is on these

grounds, for example, that the National Secular Society bases its opposition to faith schools.

Scottish politicians have taken different approaches here. The former Labour First minister Jack McConnell supported local authorities planning to establish shared campuses between Catholic and non-denominational schools. A shared campus was established in Dalkieth in 2005, but there were ongoing arguments about what facilities should be shared, including whether staff should use the same staffroom and whether children should have contact with each other at break and lunchtime. Subsequently, the Catholic Church withdrew its support from plans drawn up by North Lanarkshire for further shared campus schools. The newly elected SNP First Minister Alec Salmond delivered the 2008 Cardinal Winning Education lecture, in which he promised his 'unswerving support' for Catholic schools in Scotland. 'For too long', he commented, 'the attitude of some has been at best, grudging acceptance of Catholic education and, at worst, outright hostility'.

The most serious questioning of Catholic schools in Scotland has come from the Education Institute for Scotland (EIS), the main trades union representing Scottish teachers. The legislation governing denominational schools states that: 'A teacher appointed to any post on the staff of any such school by the education authority …shall be required to be approved as regards religious belief and character by representatives of the church or denominational body in whose interest the school has been conducted'. All teachers (not just Catholics) applying to work in a Catholic school must seek approval from the bishop of the diocese in which they with to work. In order to obtain this approval, the teacher must demonstrate how his or her personal 'religious belief and character' enables him or her to undertake the particular duties of the post for which they are applying. The prospective teacher is required to provide a statement demonstrating that they support the goals of Catholic education as set out in the document *A Charter for Catholic Schools in Scotland*. All teachers are required to provide a reference as to their 'religious belief and character', and Catholic teachers are required to obtain this from their parish priest. EIS objections to this are that teachers in non-denominational schools do not have a test of religious belief and character, and the existing arrangement appears to run counter to the Human Rights Act and the Equality Act, which prohibit discrimination on the grounds of religion and belief.

The situation was further enflamed by an agreement struck between Strathclyde Regional Council and the Catholic Church in 1991, according to which non-Catholic teachers could be appointed to any post in a Catholic school, but the posts of headteacher, assistant principal, guidance and RE teacher would be preserved for Catholics. David McNab, an atheist maths teacher in Glasgow, took Glasgow City Council to an industrial tribunal on the grounds that his application for a guidance post had been blocked on the grounds that he was not a Catholic. His case was upheld. Legal challenges of this nature are likely to continue since there is a great deal of competition for promoted posts in secondary schools, where it appears that about 50% of staff are non-Catholic, in marked contrast to primary schools where more than 95% of staff are Catholic. However, exact figures on the religious affiliation of teachers in Catholic schools are not published.

2 c Religious education provision

In this section, we provide an overview of the philosophy of religious education in the UK and in Scotland, and we subsequently contrast the stated approach to religious education in Catholic schools with that in non-denominational schools. Our review of the literature suggests that there is a dearth of qualitative studies exploring what actually takes place in religious and moral education classes and in religious observance sessions in Catholic and non-denominational schools in different parts of Scotland.

The underlying philosophy of current religious education in the UK

Barnes (2006) outlines and critiques the orthodox approach to religious education in the UK. He notes that there is general agreement on the 'direction of travel', with confessionalism giving way to neutrality and indoctrination to education. However, he maintains, the story is slightly more complicated than this and should be treated rather more critically. The movement described above might be represented in terms of more enlightened views overtaking previous views which were more partisan and, possibly, more intolerant. However, it is important to understand these views in terms of the dominance of a particular philosophical take on religion, which might be described as the liberal Protestant position. This would interpret religion in terms of inner subjectivity, situated within the self in private experience. This means that the particular religion chosen by an individual is almost irrelevant, since all faiths may be regarded as potentially offering similar spiritual experiences to the individual. Barnes maintains that much religious education in UK schools reflects this position, favouring a phenomenological approach to religions, describing their contours and according them parity of esteem, but certainly not pitting their truth claims against each other.

Barnes suggests, however, that whilst this approach might have merits in terms of quelling religious intolerance and ignorance, there are clear drawbacks and it might be seen as patronising and diminishing vital elements of particular religions, which are actually based on making truth claims which are incompatible with those of other religions. He points out that, in order to effect a reconciliation between the different religions, it is necessary for adherents to revise their beliefs. For example, the Qur'an cannot literally contain the very words of God because those words condemn other religions as (at best) untrue. Similarly, whereas Christians believe that the divine is personal and Trinitarian, Jews and Muslims deny this. Each version of religion believes its doctrines faithfully represent the true nature of reality, and there is a general denial that it is possible to have a multiple religious identity. People 'convert' to Islam or Christianity – they cannot simultaneously be members of both religions. Children are likely to encounter this view of religion at home and in their communities, and they may well be confused when a view of the unity of all religions is presented in school. Ultimately, Barnes thinks that there should be a greater emphasis on the specific doctrines of given religions, and an acknowledgement of their incompatibility, rather than a privileging of the liberal Protestant account of the unity and equality of religions which underpins the multi-faith approach.

In journals such as the British Journal of Religious Education, some articles attempt to evaluate the effectiveness of RE. Huggins (2002), for example, reported findings from a survey of pupils in ten primary and five secondary schools in England crossing years 6 and 7. Teachers' views were also sought. It appears that RE was perceived less positively than other subjects in terms of enjoyment, achievement and progress, and thee was some worsening of attitudes between years 6 and 7 (children aged 11

and 12 in the last year of primary and the first year of secondary education), suggesting poor co-ordination between the primary and secondary curricula.

There is also ongoing discussion about the relationship between citizenship education and religious education, particularly south of the Border. The *Diversity and Citizenship Curriculum Review*, chaired by Sir Keith Ajegbo, is informed by the liberal belief that citizenship education should be concerned with creating social cohesion by enabling students to identify universal values within society, whilst at the same time recognising and respecting diversity within particular cultures. The possible synergies and tensions between religious education and citizenship education tend to be skirted round, with very little mention of religious education in the review. Some writers, such as Pike (2008) have argued for a much closer rapprochement between citizenship education and religious education. Unless informed by strong belief systems which typify adherence to particular faith groups, he suggests, citizenship education may become increasingly bland and lacking in inspiration.

Religious education in Catholic schools

There has been little critical and analytical writing on religious and moral education in Scottish schools. However, it is evident that the broad goals of RME, outlined in the *Curriculum Guidelines for Religious Education*, draw heavily on the phenomenological approach associated with the liberal Protestant tradition of personal search outlined above (Rodger, 1999). The three stated aims are the following:

- To help pupils identify the area of religion in terms of the phenomena of religions and the human experiences from which they arise.
- To enable pupils to explore the nature and meaning of existence in relation to the questions religions pose and the answers they propose
- To encourage pupils to develop a consistent set of beliefs, attitudes and practices which are the result of a personal process of growth, search and discovery.

The guidelines on religious and moral education within the *Curriculum for Excellence* appear to be following the same general principles (see Country Notes). It is evident, however, that there is some deviation from this broad approach in Catholic schools, where detailed diocesan syllabi are followed alongside national guidelines. The clearly states aim in Catholic schools is to provide faith formation and socialisation into Catholicism. In this sense, Catholic religious education is not agnostic with regard to the relative merits of different religions, but is clearly aiming to contribute to the faith formation of the next generation of Catholics.

Religious observance

The Scottish Executive Education Department published the report of an inquiry into religious observance in schools in 2004. As set out in the Country Notes, since the 1872 Education Act, religious observance has been compulsory in Scottish schools. The Education (Scotland) Act 1980 repeated the provision of earlier legislation, giving local authorities 'liberty to continue said custom' (that of religious observance) and prohibiting them from discontinuing it without a poll of local electors. HMIe had noted that many secondary school headteachers had discontinued religious observance, not through negligence, but because they were unsure as to the form it should take at a time of increasing diversity and the growing presence of different faith groups.

The group concluded that the aims of religious observance were as follows:

- To promote the spiritual development of all members of the school community;
- To express and celebrate the shared values of the school community.

It was noted that where the school community was continuous with a faith community (an assumption made in relation to Catholic schools, although in some circumstances non-Catholics may outnumber Catholics), then the focus of worship might be that of the particular religious community. However, where there is a diversity of beliefs and practices, as in most non-denominational secondary schools, then acts of worship should not normally take place within the space designated for religious observance, but should be part of the informal curriculum, available for pupils to opt into, but not compulsory. Essentially, the Inquiry indicated that whereas Catholic schools could legitimately use religious observance for the celebration of Mass or for Catholic prayers, non-denominational schools would be expected to have diverse forms of religious observance, reflecting the beliefs of members of all faiths or those without any religious belief. This is an interesting position, because it suggests that religious observance sessions may be used to celebrate secular values, as long as these are connected in some way to the development of spirituality or morality.

Questions have been asked about whether the religious position adopted in Catholic schools is compatible with other aspects of the curriculum, for example, personal and social education. In particular, anxieties have been expressed about whether sex education delivered in Catholic schools complies with the Scottish Government's sexual health strategy. Research carried out for the Scottish Government's health promotion agency, NHS Scotland, (van Teijlingen, 2008) found that there were general problems with the delivery of sex education because teachers felt untrained and were worried about parental reactions. The report, entitled *A Review of Sex and Relationships Education in Scottish Secondary Schools* found that there were particular issues in Catholic schools relating to sexual health education because of the 'dominant moral code'. Responding to an article in Scotland on Sunday on this topic (SoS, 6th April 2008), a spokesman for the Catholic Church said that Catholic schools taught that homosexuality was intrinsic to the individual and homosexuals cannot be discriminated against. 'However', he went on, 'We do not condone homosexual behaviour and we would not send pupils to family planning clinics, abortion providers or other agencies'.

2d. Teachers: as a profession; teacher preparation and teaching; influence as role models; profile of teachers (especially religious background)

Catholic teachers

In an earlier section, we discussed the requirement that all teachers in Catholic schools be approved by the Bishop, and that Catholic teachers provide a reference from their parish priest to attest to the fact they he or she is known in the parish, and is a regular mass attender. These requirements have been controversial, and the Education Institute for Scotland highlighted possible clashes with legislation prohibiting discrimination on grounds of religion, belief or sexual identity. The Charter for Catholic Schools outlines ten elements of the church's philosophy of education, and all teachers in Catholic schools, whether Catholic, Protestant, Muslim or of no faith are expected to support them. Misgivings concerning the justice of such requirements have been fuelled by statements made by churchmen such as the Bishop of Motherwell, Joseph Devine, who stated in 2005: 'Being openly gay would not be at all compatible with the Charter' (http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/scotland/4366075.stm). The president of the Catholic Education Commission supported Bishop Devine's stance, stating: 'It would cut across the whole moral vision enshrined in the charter and it would be offering a

lifestyle that is incompatible with Catholic social teaching. Being openly gay could well affect promotions'. There are also questions about whether it would be acceptable for an atheist to be appointed to teach in a Catholic school. Bradley (2000), in a chapter underlining the distinctiveness of Catholic education, argues that Catholic parents want their children to be taught by committed Catholics:

> …many Catholics in Scotland believe it is important that certain subjects are taught by conscientious Catholics. Where subjects like modern studies can continually engage not only in politics, sociology, history but morality too, a Catholic and Christian dimension is viewed as important to the content, style and method of teaching. If a Catholic teacher states that cosmology, Darwinism or science has proved the improbability of the existence of God, then the Catholic school comes into conflict with the values of the home and the parish' (Bradley, 2000, p.169).

As noted earlier, at least 95% of teachers in Catholic primary schools identify as Catholic, whereas in secondary schools a much lower proportion are Catholic (about 50%).

Religion and teacher education

Teacher training within Scotland takes place within university departments of education. The emphasis for primary trainees, and for those training to teach religious and moral education in the secondary school sector, is on multi-faith education, with an emphasis on the spiritual development of pupils within an ethnically diverse and increasingly secular society. Whilst all Scottish universities are secular, Glasgow University Department of Education runs a teacher training course designed to prepare teachers to work in Catholic schools. Historically, there were a number of Catholic teacher training colleges in Scotland, often with strong links to religious orders. Gradually, these were merged with secular institutions, and St Andrew's College in Glasgow, the last surviving Catholic teacher training college, was merged with the University of Glasgow in 2000. The merger was quite stormy, with members of the existing department of education questioning whether a religious college could be incorporated into a secular institution. The Faculty website indicates that priority is given to candidates who indicate, in their personal statement, their intention to teach in Catholic schools and to seek the Catholic Teacher's Certificate in Religious Education. However, students are also informed that their qualification will enable them equally to teach in the non-denominational sector.

Research on the attitudes and motivations of trainee teachers in Catholic schools has been conducted largely by lecturers within the Faculty of Education at Glasgow University. Coll (2007) interviewed 26 primary and secondary teachers' early perception of themselves as Catholic educators in Scotland. She noted that they had all been to Catholic schools and most had a taken-for-granted view of themselves as Catholics. The majority had a positive experience of their own Catholic education, although a few had very negative experiences of Catholic indoctrination. Despite having declared their intention to teach in the Catholic sector in order to gain a place in the Glasgow University Faculty of Education, they varied greatly in their religiosity, some attending church frequently and others rarely or never. They also varied greatly in their assessment of how well they understood the teaching of the Catholic Church, and their confidence in teaching RE from a Catholic perspective. Coll reports that they all had positive views of their experiences of RE teaching at Glasgow University (although this might have been influenced by the fact that they were being interviewed by their lecturer!). She acknowledges the fact that the requirement for a

letter of support from a priest in order to obtain a job in a Catholic school might encourage strategic compliance, and suggests that 'it would seem reasonable to expect closer monitoring of the faith position of staff *during* their career in addition to the approval process before they start'. This argument is developed in a paper on Catholic teachers and CPD (Coll, 2006), in which Coll argues that there is a need for Catholic teachers to devote time to personal faith formation as part of their professional development.

Supply of teachers in Scotland

Riddell and Tett (2006) conduced a review for the Scottish Executive of the composition of the teaching profession in Scotland in light of recruitment difficulties in secondary schools, and, in particular, problems in retaining and recruiting male teachers. The data suggest that the trend towards a feminised teaching profession is set to continue, and there are likely to be major difficulties in recruiting teachers to work in secondary schools, particular in subjects such as Maths and Physics. This suggests that Catholic secondary schools may experience even greater difficulty in recruiting Catholic teachers in the future, particularly in secondary schools and in certain subject areas. A possible knock-on effect of teacher shortages in secondary schools is that the test of religious belief and character will become increasingly difficult to enforce, as it probably already is. Overall, there is a dearth of research on the religious backgrounds of teachers in Catholic and non-denominational schools in Scotland. Furthermore, there is no data with regard to the ongoing religiosity of teachers who identify as Catholic on appointment to a particular post. Finally, the attitudes towards religion of non-Catholic teachers in Catholic and non-denominational schools would be interesting to explore.

2e. School outcomes and processes, both cognitive and non-cognitive

It is commonplace in Scotland to make statements about the enhanced effectiveness of Catholic schools in Scotland compared with non-denominational schools. However, on close examination the evidence to support these statements seems to be rather thin on the ground. In this section we review the evidence and consider some possible explanations for the types of statements which are made.

Educational qualifications by religion

The 2001 Scottish Census provided information on the highest level of qualification by religion. Below, we provide two tables, the first presenting data for those in the 16-74 age group and the second presenting data for those in the 16-29 age group. The 2001 Census defines the highest level of qualification as follows:

Group 1	'O' grade, Standard grade, Intermediate 1, Intermediate 2, City and Guilds Craft, SVQ level 1, or 2, or equivalent
Group 2	Higher grade, CSYS, ONC, OND, City and Guilds Advanced Craft, RSA Advanced Diploma, SVQ level 3 or equivalent
Group 3	HND, HNC, RSA Higher Diploma, SVQ Level 4 or 5 or equivalent
Group 4	First degree, Higher Degree, Professional qualification

Table 9: Highest level of qualification by current religion of all people aged 16-74 years (Row percentages)

	No qualifications or qualifications outwith these groups	Group 1	Group 2	Group 3	Group 4	Base
Church of Scotland	38	25	14	6	16	1,601,665
Roman Catholic	39	24	15	7	16	607,151
Other Christian	25	21	17	7	31	263,520
Buddhist	26	12	15	7	40	6,066
Hindu	14	10	13	5	58	4,589
Jewish	23	15	20	5	37	4,593
Muslim	39	18	14	8	22	28,979
Sikh	42	21	14	7	16	4,668
Another Religion	10	16	30	11	33	23,996
No Religion	25	26	18	8	23	1,022,709
Not answered	31	26	17	7	19	163,143
All Groups	33	25	16	7	19	3,731,079

Table 10: Highest level of qualification by current religion of all people aged 16-29 years (Row percentages)

	No qualifications or qualifications outwith these groups	Group 1	Group 2	Group 3	Group 4	Base
Church of Scotland	12	37	27	11	14	271,946
Roman Catholic	13	35	27	10	15	144,673
Other Christian	8	24	35	8	25	58,681
Buddhist	15	15	28	9	32	1,640
Hindu	7	9	25	5	53	1,867
Jewish	9	15	40	7	29	978
Muslim	22	23	24	11	19	11,740
Sikh	19	28	25	10	17	1,695
Another Religion	4	15	43	12	26	12,330
No Religion	11	35	27	10	16	332,186
Not answered	14	35	28	9	14	46,044
All Groups	12	34	28	10	16	883,780

Some interesting findings emerge here. First, there is virtually no difference between the educational qualifications of Catholics and members of the Church of Scotland. Secondly, of those aged 16-29, Muslims and Sikhs are most likely to have no qualifications. Thirdly, over half of Hindus in the 16-29 age group have a degree. This compares to only 14% of people form the Church of Scotland and 15% of Roman Catholics.

Effectiveness of Catholic schools

Belief in the relative effectiveness of Catholic schools is strong in Scotland. Willms (1992) used the 1981 Scottish School Leavers Survey to analyse the educational and

occupational attainment of a cohort of pupils who started their secondary schooling between 1974 and 1976 and left in 1980. The analysis extended earlier work by McPherson and Willms (1986), which found that pupils attending Catholic schools came from lower socio-economic backgrounds than pupils attending non-denominational schools. After controlling for SES, at the individual level, the attainment of pupils attending Catholic schools was more than 10 per cent of a standard deviation higher than for pupils attending denominational schools. The later analysis by Willms confirmed the earlier finding, but noted in addition that disproportionately more Catholics were unemployed nine months after leaving school. The explanation for superior attainment of Catholics is that their educational progress was historically constrained by social and economic factors, but with the advent of comprehensive education far grater educational opportunities opened up. This analysis is supported by later analyses conducted by Paterson and Ianelli (2006) in relation to religion and social mobility in Scotland. Dronkers (2001) draws on this work to argue that Catholic schools in Scotland are more effective than non-denominational schools. However, it should be borne in mind that these analyses draw on data gathered more than twenty five years ago, and there are no more recent analyses of the effectiveness of Catholic schools in Scotland.

Recent claims of Catholic school effectiveness have tended to refer to HMIe reports, which are based on inspectors' professional judgements of the quality of education, backed up by parent and pupil surveys. These reports often show that Catholic schools have lower raw results than the national average, although sometimes higher results than schools with comparable intakes, reflecting the fact that many Catholic schools serve socially disadvantaged communities in the west central belt. However, the inspectors often comment on the schools' positive ethos. However, an important point to be made here is that no systematic comparison has taken place of the school ethos of catholic and non-denominational schools in Scotland. In addition, even if Catholic schools were found to be generally better in terms of school ethos, account would have to be taken of the following points:

- Many pupils in Catholic schools are from non-Catholic backgrounds (the proportion is not published), as are teachers in Catholic secondary schools.
- Parents have made a conscious choice to send their child to a Catholic rather than a non-denominational school. The most influential factor might therefore be parents' involvement in their child's education, rather than distinctive features of the school.

A significant factor in the promotion of Catholic schools is likely to be the advocacy activities of the Scottish Education Service, set up in 2003 by the Catholic Education Commission to develop Catholic schools and publicise their achievements. No such organisation exists to promote the achievements of non-denominational schools. SCES has proved highly effective in focusing press attention on positive features of Catholic schools, arguing that they 'naturally' have a tighter connection with the local community. The positive public image created by such claims is currently not supported by systematic evidence, and is certainly not indicated by superior raw results in Catholic schools.

Conclusion

Discussion of Catholic schools in Scotland has been dominated by ongoing debates in relation to the position of the Catholic community in Scotland. Grace (2002) has noted that separate Catholic schools have been defended historically as a bulwark against decades of discrimination against Catholics. However, as sociologists have demonstrated, there is no evidence of systematic discrimination against Catholics in

education, employment or any other aspect of life in modern Scotland. Social attitude data support a secularisation thesis, with Catholics having similar attitudes to personal morality as other Scots, with the possible exception of their stance on abortion. Despite the lack of hard evidence of systematic discrimination, and the similarity in attitudes between Catholics and others, there is a fairly widespread belief that anti-Catholic discrimination persists.

Catholic schools justify their existence on two grounds. First, spokesmen often refer to ongoing sectarianism, and secondly, there are claims that Catholic schools are more effective than others, although there is little evidence to support this. Catholic schools continue to insist that all teachers must have their character and beliefs approved by the Bishop, and this is seen as an unfair practice by teachers' trades unions.

In general, the focus on Catholic schools has distracted attention from many other pressing issues in Scottish education, including high levels of inequality in attainment linked to social class, and the marginalisation of minority ethnic and religious groups, particularly Muslims. Islamophobia and Anglophobia may be far more important and pressing issues than has to date been recognised.

The review highlights significant gaps in knowledge, some of which the REMC project will be able to address. Areas where more research is needed include the following:

- The relative effectiveness of Catholic and non-denominational schools in relation to attainment and ethos.

- The salience of religion and ethnicity as factors influencing parental choice of school, and the relationship if these factors with others such as social class and geography.

- The criteria used by schools and local authorities in allocating places to pupils, and the part played by religion in these selection procedures.

- Social and educational experiences of specific groups of pupils, in relation to religion and other variables, in Catholic and non-denominational schools.

- The way in which particular groups of pupils experience religious and moral education and religious observance in Catholic and non-denominational schools.

- Teachers' experiences of working in Catholic and non-denominational schools.

REFERENCES

Adler, M., Petch, A. & Tweedie, J. (1989) *Parental Choice and Educational Policy* (Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press).

Allen, R. & West, A. (2007) Religious schools in London: School admissions, religious composition and selectivity? *British Education Research Association (BERA) Annual Conference* (London,

Archer, L. (2003) *'Race', Masculinity and Schooling: Muslim Boys and Education* (Buckingham, Open University Press).

Arshad, R. (2003) 'Race relations in Scotland' in J. Crowther, I. Martin and M Shaw (eds.) *Renewing Democracy in Scotland* (Leicester: NIACE).

Ball, S.J. (2003) Class Strategies and the Education Market London: RoutledgeFalmer.

Barnes, P. (2006) The misrepresentation of religion in modern British (religious) education, *British Journal of Educational Studies*, 54(4), pp. 395-411.

Bond, R. & Rosie, M. (2002) National Identities in Post-Devolution Scotland. Edinburgh, Institute of Governance. Online paper (www.institute-of-governance.org/onlinepub/bondrosie.html) Accessed on 07 April 2008

Bradley, J.M. (2000) 'A need to be different' in T.Devine (Ed.) *Scotland's Shame? Bigotry and Sectarianism in Modern Scotland* (Edinburgh, Mainstream).

Bromley, C. & Curtice, J. (2003) *Attitudes to Discrimination in Scotland* (Edinburgh, Scottish Executive Social Research).

Bruce, S. & Glendinning, T. (2003) Religious Beliefs and Differences, in: C. Bromley, J. Curtice, K. Hinds & A. Park (Eds) *Devolution - Scottish Answers to Scottish Questions* (Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press).

Bruce, S., Glendinning, T., Paterson, I. & Rosie, M. (2004) *Sectarianism in Scotland* (Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press).

Bruce, S., Glendinning, T., Paterson, I. & Rosie, M. (2005) Religious discrimination in Scotland: Fact or myth?, *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 28(1), pp. 151-168.

Commission on Integration and Cohesion (CoIC) (2007) *Our Shared Future* (London, Department for Communities and Local Government) [available at:. www.integrationandcohesion.org.uk]

Coldron, J., E.Tanner, Finch, S., Shipton, L., Wolstenholme, C., Willis, B., Demack, S. & Stiell, B. (2008) Secondary School Admissions (Sheffield, Sheffield Hallam University with National Centre for Social Research).

Coll, R. (2006) Faith formation in the context of continuing professional development for Catholic teachers: understanding the views of the managers, *Journal of In-Service Education*, 32(4), pp. 431-450.

Coll, R. (2007) Student teachers' perception of their role and responsibilities as Catholic educators, *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 30(4), pp. 445-465.

Commission on Integration and Cohesion (2007) *Our Shared Future* (London, Commission on Integration and Cohesion).

Conroy, J. (2001) A very Scottish affair: Catholic education and the State, *Oxford Review of Education*, 27(4), pp. 543-558.

Department for Education and Skills (DfES) (2007) *Curriculum review: Diversity and Citizenship (Ajegbo report)* PPSLS/D35/0107/14 (London, DfES).

Devine, T. (2000a) Preface, in: T. Devine (Ed) *Scotland's Shame? Bigotry and Sectarianism in Modern Scotland* (Edinburgh, Mainstream).

Devine, T. (2000b) Then and Now: Catholics in Scottish society, 1950-2000, in: T. Devine (Ed) *Scotland's Shame? Bigotry and Sectarianism in Modern Scotland* (Edinburgh, Mainstream).

Dronkers, J. (2001) More parental choice in Europe? Overview of the effectiveness differences between Religious schools and Public schools in several European countries*Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association* (Seattle, WA,

Echols, F. & Willms, J. (1995) Reasons for school choice in Scotland, *Journal of Education Policy*, 10(2), pp. 143-156.

Field, C. (2001) The Haemorrhage of Faith?' Opinion Polls as Sources for Religious Practices, Beliefs and Attitudes in Scotland since the 1970s, *Journal of Contemporary Religion*, 16(2), pp. 157-175.

Finn, G.P.T. (1999) Sectarianism and Scottish Education, in: T.G.K. Bryce & W.M. Humes (Eds) *Scottish Education* (Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press).

Gorard, S., Fitz, J. & Taylor, C. (2001) School choice impacts: what do we know?, *Educational Researcher*, 30(7), pp. 18-23.

Grace, G. (2002) Catholic Schools: Mission, Markets and Morality (London, RoutledgeFalmer).

Hopkins, P. (2004) Young Muslim men in Scotland: Inclusions and exclusions, *Children's Geographies*, 2(2), pp. 257-272.

Huggins, M. (2002) Crossing the Key Stages of Religious Education: Pupils' and Teachers' Perceptions of RE in Years 6 and 7, *British Journal of Religious Education*, 24(2), pp. 86-98.

Hussain, A. & Miller, W. (2004) Anglophobia & Islamophobia in Scotland*ESRC Devolution & Constitutional Change Programme*

Hussain, A. & Miller, W. (2007) *Multicultural Nationalism* (Oxford, Oxford University Press).

MacMillan, J. (2000) Scotland's shame, in: T. Devine (Ed) *Scotland's Shame? Bigotry and Sectarianism in Modern Scotland* (Edinburgh, Mainstream).

McAspurren, L. (2005) Religious Discrimination & Sectarianism in Scotland: A Brief Review of Evidence (2002-2004)*Scottish Executive Social Research* (Edinburgh, Scottish Executive).

McPherson, A.F. & Willms, J.D. (1986) The socio-historical construction of school contexts and their effects on contemporary pupil attainment in Scotland, in: A.C. Kerckhoff (Ed) *Research in Sociology of Education and Socialisation, Vol. 6* (Greenwich, JAI Press).

OECD (2007) *Quality and Equity of Schooling in Scotland* (Paris, OECD).

Osler, A. (2007) Faith Schools and Community Cohesion(London, Runnymede Trust).

Paterson, L. (2000) Salvation through education? The changing social status of Scottish Catholics, in: T. Devine (Ed) *Scotland's Shame? Bigotry and Sectarianism in Modern Scotland* (Edinburgh, Mainstream).

Paterson, L. & Iannelli, C. (2006) Religion, social mobility and education in Scotland, *The British Journal of Sociology*, 57(3), pp. 353-377.

Pike, M. (2008) Faith in Citizenship? On teaching children to believe in liberal democracy, *British Journal of Religious Education*, 30(2), pp. 113-122.

Riddell, S. & Tett, L. (2006) *The Gender Balance of School Teachers in Scotland: Where have all the men gone?* (Edinburgh:, Dunedin Academic Press).

Rosie, M. & McCrone, D. (2000) The past is history: Catholics in modern Scotland, in: T. Devine (Ed) *Scotland's Shame? Bigotry and Sectarianism in Modern Scotland* (Edinburgh, Mainstream).

Scottish Executive (2003) Attitudes to Discrimination (Edinburgh, HMSO).

Scottish Executive (2005) Analysis of Religion in the 2001 Census: Summary Report (Edinburgh, Scottish Executive).

Scottish Government (2007) Choosing a School: A Guide for Parents (Edinburgh, Scottish Government).

Shain, F. (2003) *The Schooling and Identity of Asian Girls* (Stoke-on-Trent, Trentham Books).

van Teijlingen, E. (2008,) *A Review of Sex and Relationships Education in Scottish Secondary Schools* (Edinburgh, NHS Scotland).

Voas, D. (2006) Religious Decline in Scotland: New Evidence on Timing and Spatial Patterns, *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 45(1), pp. 107-118.

Walls, P. & Williams, R. (2003) Sectarianism at work: Accounts of employment discrimination against Irish Catholics in Scotland, *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 26(4), pp. 632-662.

Williams, R. & Walls, P. (2000) Going but not gone: Catholic disadvantage in Scotland, in: T. Devine (Ed) *Scotland's Shame? Bigotry and Sectarianism in Modern Scotland* (Edinburgh, Mainstream).

Willms, J.D. (1992) Pride or prejudice? Opportunity structure and the effects of Catholic Schools in Scotland, *International Persopectives on Education and Society*, 2, pp. 189-213.